

MID TERM REVIEW REPORT

Project Title: An innovative model for strengthening community based measures to curb violence against women and girls (VAWG) in Mansehra, Nawabshah and Mirpurkhas districts, Pakistan”

Conducted by: GBV Programme Team, NCA Pakistan

August- September 2016

Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	1
List of abbreviation.....	2
Executive Summary.....	3
1. Project Background.....	4
2. Purpose of the Midterm Review.....	4
2.1 Key findings of the midterm review.....	4
3. Methodology.....	5
3.1 Sample Design.....	5
4. Data Analysis.....	6
4.1 Perceived roles and responsibilities.....	6
4.2 Decision in the household.....	7
4.3 Authority over cash/ power dynamics in family.....	7
4.4 Female mobility.....	7
4.5 Attitudes and practices regarding female education.....	8
4.6 Discrimination with religious minorities.....	8
4.7 Age for marriage for girls / boys.....	9
4.8 Girls and women consulted for their marriage decision.....	9
4.9 Trend of large dowry.....	9
4.10 Trend of exchange marriages.....	10
4.11 Perception of domestic violence against women.....	10
4.12 Social Actions to reduce GBV by organization / activist/ Institution.....	11
4.13 Role of Jirga / Panchayat.....	12
4.14 Perception about Media.....	12
4.15 Role of religious leaders.....	13
4.16 Role of Marriage Registrars.....	13
4.17 Role of police officers.....	14
4.18 Role of Revenue officers in inheritance related matters.....	14
4.19 Role of Lady Health Worker (LHW).....	15
4.20 Partner engagement with the community groups.....	15
4.21 Attitudes and practices regarding marriage registration.....	15
4.22 GBV Response services.....	16
4.23 Media consumption (radio and TV).....	16
4.24 Perception about masculinity.....	16
5. Key Informants/ Stakeholders/ Duty bearers' response.....	17
6. Constraints/ Challenges.....	19
7. Recommendation/ Area for improvements.....	20
8. Annexes.....	20

List of abbreviation

BISP	Benazir Income Support Program
BB	Baanhn Beli
CDF	Community Development Foundation
CII's	Council of Islamic Ideology
CNIC	Computerized National Identity Card
COS	Church of Sweden
CSOs	Civil Society Organization
CWS	Community World Service Asia
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
DWG	District Watch Groups
DV	Domestic Violence
ECM	Early Child Marriage
EU	European Union
FGDs	Focus Group Discussions
GBV	Gender Based Violence
HH	Household
KACC	Khwendo Kor Area Coordination Committee
KGM	Kot Ghulam Muhammad
KIIs	Key Informant Interviews
KK	Khwendo Kor
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LHW	Leady Health Worker
MTR	Mid Term Review
NCA	Norwegian Church Aid
ROM	Result Oriented Monitoring
SAPPK	South Asia Partnership Pakistan
SBA	Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah)
SO	Specific Objective
SoW	Scope of Work
SRHR	Sexual Reproductive Health Rights
SSSF	Shah Sachal Sami Foundation
TORs	Terms of References
VAWG	Violence Against Women and Girls
VCDO	Village Community Development Organization
VDO	Village Development Organization
WCC	Women Complaint Cell
WRI	Women's Right to Inheritance

Executive Summary

The applicant (NCA) and co-applicants namely SAPPK and KK have previous experience of preventing forced marriages and acting against denial of inheritance rights to women. In both cases, it is easy to assess whether an outcome favours women or not. The law related to both these violations was passed in 2011, and constitutional provisions as well as Muslim religious doctrine both consider each a crime as well as a sin. For these reasons, the action focused on tackling these relatively less controversial violations at the community level. Both these problems are interlinked in order to keep property within the family, thus girls are forcibly married to the Quran, a life-long vow of abstinence, so that their share of inheritance does not have to be given to them. Studies link women's ability to realise their rights and status in the family to their economic position, which is a product of their ownership of land, assets and other types of property. The action also address the problem of dowry, which is a major factor resulting in domestic violence and denial of inheritance, and contributes to cases of forced marriage. The action focused on awareness raising on prevention of DV, which is a much more accepted social norm that has only recently been criminalized.

During the MTR, the noticeable feature was parents' positive attitude, practice and realization regarding girls' education. Almost all the interacted community groups confirmed that parents want their children to get education but lack of education facility in their vicinity is a major reason to continue education after primary or middle level schooling.

MTR finding revealed that the trend of dowry was generally not prevalent in communities living in Sindh province. However, in Mansehra (KP province) the trend of dowry was significantly common and there is a pressure on families for dowry due to which their daughters remain unmarried. In Sindh, trend of exchange marriages is also very common in Muslim tribes such as Syed, Baloch, Jokhayo, Jamali, Brohi and Kapri. Whereas it does not exist in Hindu tribes. In district Mansehra trend of exchange marriages is not common.

Most of the respondents during the MTR expressed zero tolerance for GBV. According to them, men should not lay hands upon women and violence at any cost should not be accepted. This type of response reveal that somehow attitudes are changing among husbands, men and boys in the community and community leaders. Interviews with partners' key stakeholders and community group members found that many men are beginning to realize social benefits of women's participation in the community groups, The MTR team noticed that the process of deconstruction regarding masculinity and GBV has been started among men and youth. At least they verbally shown zero tolerance on GBV and to them violence has adverse effects on the development of children.

The attitudes of most of the local leaders are also changing and becoming more supportive. Religious leaders are also becoming more aware and sensitized over women rights and almost all the interacted respondents stated zero tolerance on violence on women in the project intervention area. Moreover, the interacted religious leaders realized the need to support survivors of sexual and gender based violence (including domestic violence) and are now more aware that they have a role to play in raising awareness that all types of gender based violence are unacceptable and should be prevented.

1. Project Background

Project Title: “An innovative model for strengthening community based measures to curb violence against women and girls (VAWG) in Mansehra, Nawabshah and Mirpurkhas districts, Pakistan”.

The **overall objective** of the action is to contribute to enhanced social and collective action in local communities to detect, prevent and respond to VAWG, specifically domestic violence (DV) and forced marriage. The action will address the violation of women and girls basic human rights i.e. VAWG by focusing on prevention and response through a two-tiered approach: (1) Survivors of VAWG have enhanced access to justice and safety, through response services, referrals and adherence to applicable laws; (2) Community measures prevent and act against domestic violence and forced marriages, by empowering women through facilitation of inheritance. The two specific objectives of the action are: **1)** ensures that the state upholds its responsibility to ensure the safety of its female citizens, particularly survivors of VAWG or religiously motivated violence against non-Muslim women and girls, through the implementation of relevant laws. In cases where there is a violation of women and girls’ rights, the state must ensure they have access to justice. The action also aims to improve the quality of gender based violence (GBV) response provided by duty bearers; and **2)** based on the realization that top down legislative change alone does not reduce prevalence of VAWG until there is accompanying behavioural change at the local level. Rather than wait for a trickle down process, the action proactively engages rights holders as well as their communities in order to promote sustainable change based on ground realities.

2. Purpose of the Midterm Review (MTR)

The purpose of the MTR was to assess the overall progress and level of achievements made during the programme period with a special focus to:

- The results achieved through ongoing project interventions;
- To the extent possible, assess whether the project has had any positive or negative impact, intended or unintended on policy level in public and private sectors and in communities;
- Assess the constraints faced and opportunities available for growth of the project; and
- Assess the possible revisions and adjustments required for the next phase of the project.

In order to review the aforementioned focus of the interventions of this action, the applicant (NCA) conducted the midterm review during the month of August and September 2016 for this action. NCA conducted this review with support of the co-applicants’ (SAP-PK and KK) staff for this action in their respective districts.

2.1 Key Findings of the MTR

Following are the key findings of MTR:

- In most societies, women have been defined largely in terms of their maternal and caretaking roles and hence been stereotyped as “domestics”. Role that women take have been viewed as relatively of lesser significance in larger cultural picture. Male as opposed to female activities have always been recognized as being more important and cultural system has given authority to the roles of men and they have portrayed them as being of greater value. It was observed that knowledge of the community groups about the specific objectives of the action has increased as a result of their participation in the planned interventions under this action. Both males and females in the community groups are more sensitized about women issues related to GBV.
- Generally it has been observed that in management of money matters, the final decision is made by male head of the family member because he is formally recognised in the family and community as responsible to take decision how the money has to be spent. Through the interventions of the action, women’s involvement in decision-making related to money matters is now recognized by their males. For example, the male community members shared with MTR team that their wives are good savers of money and during emergencies they are the one who support the family needs from their savings. They further said that women better control cash because they have a better sense of managing and using the money.
- Women’s mobility is one of the social and as well economic factors that contribute to women’s empowerment. The community members from Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) districts revealed that only older women were allowed to go out alone in public to nearby places, while

mobility of the younger women was curtailed by their male counterparts even for emergency purposes. It was noted that as a result of the action the mobility of the younger females has been improved and they are allowed to move outside in accompany of other females (relatives or village mates) to travel to the market for household chores.

- A noticeable feature during MTR was improvement in realization among parents about the importance of girls' education. Almost all the interacted community groups confirmed that now parents want their children particularly girls to get education to have more awareness about their rights, but due to lack of middle and higher secondary schools close to their vicinity is a major reasons of school dropout after primary education in the villages.
- In rural target areas of action in Sindh, there was no trend of getting consent of the girls for their marriages. Likewise, majority of the young boys were also not consulted to have marriage of their choice. In KP province, it was learnt that fathers take the decision of their children's marriage and women were consulted half-heartedly. During MTR communities reported that now their trend is changing and some families have now started consulting their girls as well sons to get their consent for marriage. However, in some cases wishes of the girls to have choice for marriage is sometimes not respected.
- It was revealed that the trend of dowry was generally not prevalent in communities living in Sindh province. However, in Mansehra (KP province) district the trend of dowry was significantly common and there is a pressure on families of the bride for dowry and sometimes in some areas women remaining unmarried because of their inability to arrange dowry.
- In Sindh trend of exchange marriages is still common especially among Muslim tribes such as Syed, Baloch, Jokhayo, Jamali, Brohi and Kapri. While this trend does not exist among Hindu tribes. In district Mansehra (KP province) the trend of exchange marriages is not common with exception of communities of Kohistani origin (another neighbouring district, which is not part of the project's target area).
- The community groups reported zero tolerance for GBV in their target areas. According to them, men now realize that they should not lay hands upon their women and promote violence.
- The community groups also revealed that somehow attitudes are changing among husbands, men and boys in the community and community leaders, because many males have started realizing social benefits of women's participation in community groups to address issues of GBV in their families. Males have noticed that GBV has adverse effects on their children therefore in the community groups they have expressed zero tolerance to GBV in their families and villages.
- The attitudes of most of the local leaders are also changing and becoming more supportive. For example, religious leaders are also becoming more aware and sensitized about rights of women and almost all the interacted respondents stated zero tolerance on violence against women in the project intervention areas. Moreover, the religious leaders realized the need to support survivors of sexual and gender based violence (including domestic violence) because they are now aware about their role to raise awareness in the communities that all types of gender based violence are unacceptable and should be prevented.

3. Methodology

Before conducting the MTR, applicant's (NCA) project team consulted several documents to feed into the MTR process, including: Project Proposal including log frame, Project Baseline Report, ROM Report, and Annual/Bi annual reports of two co-applicants. In the MTR qualitative methodologies were applied, which provided contextual understanding of social, cultural and economic factors influencing the attitudes and behaviour of the target population of the action. The applicant's project team employed qualitative methodology to conduct the MTR, using a semi structured questionnaire to assess results of the interventions, and through qualitative tools such Key Informant Interviews and FGDs, with community groups/leaders and key personnel of co-applicants, Government officials and religious leaders. Discussions were also held with District Watch Groups in Sindh and Khwendo Kor Areas Coordination Committee (KACC) in KP and survivors of GBV.

3.1 Sample Design

For the MTR purposive selection approach was applied in terms of selection of union councils in the target areas of the intervention in three target districts. Those UCs were selected which had never been visited by NCA previously. Two villages were randomly selected from the each selected union councils. In each village 4 parallel FGDs each with men, women, boys and girls were arranged, thus the total number of FGDs in all the three districts were 20 (6 with each group in district Shaheed Benazirabad [Nawabshah]

and Mansehra and 4 in district Mirpurkhas). In addition, a total of 12 Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) were also held with the Lady Health Workers (LHW), Revenue Officer (Patwari), Police officials and religious leader those were trained by the staff of co-applicants on the health related complications due to Early Child Marriage (ECM), women's right to inheritance, gender responsive policing and awareness about women rights in women in respective religions.

Key Stakeholder Category	#s of Focus Group Discussions	Key Informant Interview (individual)	#s of Individual Interviews	Consultative Meetings
Boys and girls	10			
Men and Women	10			
Religious Leaders		3		
LHW		3		
Revenue Officers		3		
Police officer		3		
DWG and KACC				3
Survivors			6	
Project Staff				3
Total	20	12	6	6

Keeping in view the cultural context, FGDs with male and female groups were conducted separately. The Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) were held with key stakeholders and duty bearers such as LHW, Revenue officer (Patwari), and Police officials. Two KIIs were also held with Muslim religious leaders in Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) and Mansehra (KP province) whereas one KII was conducted with Bhagat/Pandit (Hindu religious leader) in district Mirpurkhas (Sindh province).

In all the three intervention districts, review meetings with District Watch Group and KACC were also held to record their perceptions and efforts for lobbying with the district authorities to address Violence against Women and Girls (VAWG) issues in their respective district. In order to know the perception and quality of services received by survivors, individual meetings were also held with 2-3 survivors in each union council. For data traceability, MTR team used the voice recorder to record discussion and interviews so that the collected data can be entered accurately and can be used for future reference if needed. In addition, other aspects that are not part of the log frame were also studied, such as elements that triggers or results GBV e.g., decision making at household level, social mobility of females, trend of dowry, consultation with girls for their marriage decision and involvement of women in cash management at the household level. Such type of information helped both co-applicants and applicant to understand the key drivers of GBV so that such issues could be addressed adequately through planned interventions of the action.

4. Data Analysis

The data was collected on the following themes;

4.1 Perceived roles and responsibilities

While observing the traditional gender roles in project intervention areas, it was revealed that women's role and responsibilities were only confined within the four walls of the household. However, upon probing, it was learnt that besides household chores (cooking and cleaning) women were involved in informal rural economy but their labour was not recognized and paid. Women were found major contributors to agricultural labours, such as cotton and chilly picking, sowing of crops, livestock care (grazing, cutting fodder and fetching water), fuel wood collection, preparation of food and taking care of the family. In addition women were also doing embroidery and stitching work and among them few were also doing jobs in education and health sector as teachers, LHWs and nurses in Mansehra district. However, in Sindh the number of women employed were almost negligible. It was also observed that adult girls also assist their mothers in managing the household chores. Majority of the girls in the intervention villages used to go to schools till primary level, and few of them acquired middle school education (8th Grade) if school was located close to their villages. Whereas men were responsible for earning bread outside home, buy eatable from the market and engaged in manual labour. In Mansehra district, it was observed that 80% of the boys go to study in schools/colleges to acquire primary education, middle school education and few of them reach to higher education

(Intermediate and Graduation) and later they struggle for employment. However, 20% of the illiterate boys opt to work in fields or become drivers.

4.2 Decision making at the household level

It was revealed that women's decision-making authority was clearly related to the context in which they live. Most of the rural women reported that their husbands and other male family members have a predominant role in household decisions making regarding purchase of household items. When respondents in district Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) were probed regarding women's participation in types of decision making, it was revealed that elderly women had greater role in deciding grandchildren's marriage. Children's schooling till primary was decided by the mothers, while education above primary level for children was decided by the father. In other decisions like sale of livestock, shared crops or purchasing of household appliances, women were consulted by their husbands. Apart from the aforementioned decisions, it was confirmed by all the participants that in major decisions women were involved. It was also observed that women usually keep cash for saving purposes which they can use during emergencies. Whereas during discussion with boys and men groups in Mansehra district it was learnt that parents collectively take decisions for marriages of their children. It was further revealed that decision regarding education of girls is taken by their fathers but boys are independent in this regard. Significant number of participants of the FGD with boys group at village Khawaja Khel, UC Bafa stated that only family heads (older men and women) make decisions at home. A considerable portion of both girls and women groups' participants of FGDs from the same village revealed that men make decisions however they do take advice from women but they consider them weak decision makers.

4.3 Authority over cash/power dynamics in family

The fact that men have primary say in terms of cash decisions can have important implications. As mentioned earlier that men usually do not interfere in women's control of day-to-day household decisions, unless something that affects the men personally is not done. Almost all the interacted participants during MTR shared that their wives keep cash and but they have little control over its use. Women usually keep cash as a savings for raining season. They further said that women control cash because they have a better sense of managing money. Discussion with men and boys in district Mansehra revealed that women are more aware of household budget and they know better what to purchase and what not, therefore women are given large portion of money. Women who have job or government service have complete control over the cash including their wages and are largely responsible to decide what needs to be spent on family needs. According to key informant interviews with LHWs, in the villages generally women control the cash, with a few exceptions of women who have no access to money. Safety termed the key reason behind keeping cash with women. Women return back the cash when is needed whereas if the same amount is kept with men that will be expensed out.

4.4 Female mobility

It is a notable fact that women's mobility is one of the social and as well economic factors that contribute to women's empowerment. Status of women was found better and GBV free where there were more opportunities for social mobility of women. The tradition of male honour associated with the chastity of their female relations restricts women's mobility, limits social interaction and imposes a check on their economic activity. The community people are feared that the females' honour will not be secured if they go out of their homes for acquiring education. There are multiple reasons besides those stated above; one of them is availability of transport facility in the rural areas. From discussion with male participants at Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) it was revealed that only older women were allowed to go out alone to a few kilo meters but younger women experience low mobility and cannot go anywhere without getting prior consent from their male counterparts even for emergency purposes. One of the boys during FGD at village Wadal Shah, district Mirpurkhas shared that "Men can take lifts while going town and back to home, if he finds no transport then he can stay at a hotel too but women cannot. Our society doesn't allow women to take lift or stay at hotel." District Mansehra (KP province) is more urban and comparatively public transport facilities are far better than Sindh thus mobility of women is significantly observed better in Mansehra. However, attitude of male segment of society for women mobility was not found encouraging in Mansehra. Community groups (boys and men) shared that, women are respected if they stay within the four walls but if they face any hardships they are socially allowed to go out or even in group or accompanied with mother or female relative to work and support their families. Few women/girls at village Khawaja Khel, UC Bafa in KP province, shared that married girls only go out if their husbands allow them to do so. They

further said that men who have pretty wives do not let them go out except for funerals and weddings. It was admitted by MTR participants that due to low mobility, girls' education is heavily compromised.

4.5 Attitudes and practices regarding female education

Education is one of the major instruments of social change and it is the force, which brings changes in the traditional outlook of the people, and it develops insight for judging things in their context. It is visualized that more the percentage of educated people more will be the rate of development. Generally in Pakistan parents prefer their sons over their daughters because they are supposed to be the helping hand for the parents. Parents tend to think that whatever they spent on sons is an investment whereas spending over daughters is a waste, because they are considered as liabilities. A hidden fear in the minds of males is that after getting education the females may start interfering in the decision making process. They are kept economically dependent on males no matter how hard they work to contribute to the family's income. Their work is not recognized as a part of contribution to the household economy. They are also deprived of their share in property.

A noticeable feature during MTR on attitude and practice regarding girls' education was the parents' realization about importance of education. Almost all the interacted community groups confirmed that parents want to educate their children but lack of education facility in their vicinity is major reasons of school dropout or not sending daughters to school which are far from the home. In urban areas, there is no issue of school dropout because affordable means of transportation are available. It was found that education of girls/women is also related to social class. Upper class women get higher education, middle class go up to college and lower income girls only get primary education or middle level education. The MTR team observed increased trend of education in girls has resulted in change in lives of women and girls. Same was observed in Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) districts, where girls are getting education till middle school (class 8th) or up to matric, however education after 8th or 10th grade was allowed to those who belongs to upper social class. In contrary to girls, boy's education status was found better because they have no restriction and can easily go to nearby villages and even town for acquiring education. Parents who are educated they send their daughters for college level education but parents who hardly make end meet cannot send their daughters in the school located even in their village. In Mansehra, educational status was higher in the village Baffa for both boys and girls. There are some schools in the surrounding areas where girls get education up to matric even the degree college for higher education is not that far and even some of the girls do go to the degree colleges with their fathers or in a group and some have even hired the pick and drop services. Majority of the participants shared that the decision regarding the education of girls is decided by their fathers but boys are independent in this regard. It was further observed that girl's education is appreciated but higher education is not acceptable owing to mobility issue as they require transportation facility to college or university for higher studies and these institutes are in urban areas. Girls lamented that boys after completion of their education find jobs whereas girls after getting education mostly remain at home and only very few could work with the permission of their parents.

4.6 Discrimination with religious minorities

The Hindu population of Pakistan makes up a small minority of about 1.96 million, or 1.2 per cent, of the total population. An overwhelming majority of the Hindus (96 per cent of the total Hindu population in Pakistan) live in rural areas of Sindh. There are heavy concentrations of Hindus in district Sanghar Mirpurkhas, Umerkot and Tharparkar. There are also small pockets of Hindus in interior Baluchistan and Punjab. The Hindus of Pakistan – residing in the interior of Sindh or Baluchistan – belong principally to the so-called untouchable class, the Scheduled Caste Hindus. Many of them are landless bonded labourers, working on the lands of big Sindhi landlords (known as Jagirdars). Those who live in towns and cities also have a menial standing and are generally employed as sanitary workers.

A significant proportion of the Hindus within the province of Sindh are so-called untouchables, the Scheduled Caste Hindus. As farmer (haris) these Scheduled Caste Hindus make up part of the pool of landless bonded labour of province of Sindh. Sindh's agricultural wealth, to a large extent, has depended on the intensive and strenuous work of bonded labour in producing hugely profitable cash crops such as sugar cane. While huge profits are made by the wealthy landlords, the landless bonded labour comprised of substantial number of Scheduled Caste Hindus communities continues to suffer from abject poverty.

In district Mirpurkhas, community group members shared that there was no discrimination on the basis of religion. Teacher treats them equally and children from religious minority play with Muslim children together. However, when asked about the drinking water facilities available to them, the children from minorities shared that they drink water from same source/water container but their glasses are kept separate and put aside from the glasses being used by Muslim children. Whereas in district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah), no such discrimination was reported by the participants in education institutions. However, discrimination by judiciary was reported by the participants in FGD. Hindu girls were abducted and forcibly converted and married but court gave verdict in favour of boy and girl was not recovered. If same is done by Hindu boys then they are tortured and harassed. Similarly, one of the participants shared that 2-3 instances of forced conversion of Hindu girls were highlighted in media and a lot was talked about them but no action was taken against the culprits.

4.7 Age for marriage for girls/boys

Interestingly, majority of the interacted respondents from both the districts of Sindh were aware about minimum age of marriage (18 as per Child Marriage Restraint Act) and the punishment of 3 years imprisonment against violation of the act. The main source of such awareness of TV and CSOs. During MTR it was shared by one of the FGD participants at KGM that there were three cases of early age marriage where community members strived in protecting the marriage of those children through persuading their parents but they did not agreed to do so and the marriage took place. Similarly the group participants at Sakrand shared that 25 years is the ideal age to get married as marriage is not only with individual as it entails with bundle of responsibilities including taking care of father in law, mother in law, children and other relatives of husbands. The group participants were also aware about the disadvantages of early marriages such as health challenges for mother and children, child and maternal mortality, and inability to handle so much responsibilities due to lack of maturity.

Whereas in Mansehra KP province, Child Marriage Restraint Act 1929 (No XIX) is enacted, however, majority of the interacted participants were not acquaint with the act. However, majority of them were aware that age for marriage must be above 18 years. The participants opined that for boys' marriage 20-25 years and for girls 18-20 years age is suitable. The group further stated that girls reach puberty at early age therefore their age should be two years lesser at the time of marriage (18-20 years). It was also revealed during discussions that nowadays most of the boys and girls age crosses 25 years when married.

4.8 Girls and women consulted for their marriage decision

During discussion with participants in district Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) districts, it was revealed that before the project intervention mothers teach their daughter that they have to say yes at the time of Nikah (marriage solemnization). There was no trend of consultation with girls for their marriage whereas boys were sometimes asked for their opinion. During the project intervention, it was observed that in a few families girls are now consulted for marriage and their wishes are respected. In KP province, it was observed that most of the men and young boys were aware about the importance of the consent in terms of marriage, moreover it was learnt that fathers take the decision of their children's marriage and with the consent of their daughters.

4.9 Trend of large dowry

Dowry is a kind of compensation which is given by the parents of Bride to the Groom or his parents. It may be cash amount, some furniture, vehicle or other kind of house used products. It is a dreadful and unethical practice. It is not a practice for which there is religious sanction, but it continues to be practiced in many countries of the world today. It is equally common and practiced among the educated and illiterate people. Even the educated people own this system with pride. The upper class of our society gives dowry according to their own status. They provide things from basic needs to things which come in luxuries including luxury cars, luxury bungalows to show off their wealth. The class of poor people they are being grinded in the competition of dowry and as a result they are not able to marry their daughter. It is an act of discrimination against unmarried girls, whose values are defined based on the prices of their respective dowries. It is an example of greed and selfishness and is a great curse, especially for the parents who belong to the lower middle class. This is the reason why people get depressed and feel cursed at the birth of a daughter. It has also been noticed that mainstream media is promoting and commercializing dowry through commercials, shows, drama serial and advertisements. The promotion of dowry has negatively influenced to the audience.

MTR findings reveals that in Sindhi communities generally the trend of dowry is not prevalent because majority of the immigrants (Urdu speaking communities) and some castes of Hindu communities living in district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawabshah) discourage this practice. However, some minor dowry is given in lieu of inheritance share in the property. Instead of right to inheritance, daughters are given only dowry/ crockery, bed and clothes and cattle (goat or cow) as a gift. MTR findings in district Mirpurkhas show that in parts of Sindh, cattle are given as division of assets. In some of the families division is made at very early stage even when daughters are young and not engaged for wedding. One of such instance was observed in a remote village Wadal Shah, district Mirpurkhas where a young girl named Saba owns two goats, though at her home there were several cows and goats but she cared more to the goats which were on her name. She fed her goats more than that of her siblings. It was shared by both men and women that they have no land holdings and those who possess is too small to distribute among the children. However, they have sufficient livestock and most of the parents distribute the livestock among their children at the time of marriage. Daughters are given significant share of livestock at wedding or prior wedding. That is what they termed it inheritance whereas crockery, utensils and household appliances, furniture are gift to the bride. In Mansehra trend of dowry is significantly common. There is a pressure for dowry on bride's family, which results in some women remaining unmarried. In many families right to Inheritance is not given to the girls and families usually give a lot of dowry to the girls instead. At one of the village of UC Bufa, FGD participants shared that around 25-30% girls may stay unmarried due to dowry." FGD participants of both girls' and boys' groups confirmed that there is a pressure from boy's side to demand a lot of dowry. From FGD with women participants at village Khwaja Khel revealed that in few cases, parents marry their daughters off with a man of older age who doesn't demand dowry. Girls who bring fewer dowries with them get to hear a lot of taunts from their in-laws.

4.10 Trend of exchange marriages

Child marriage is often used as an instrument to perpetuate power relations and maintain gender based control. It is generally believed that younger girls can be easily tamed the way male-elders want. Watta satta (exchange marriages, e.g., bridegroom's sister married to bride's brother in exchange) also serves to maintain the balance of power between both families to make sure that their girls are fully secured, i.e., not easily divorced, because if one couple decides to give divorce the other couple has to do the same due to family pressure in spite of living a happy life. Such marriages are mostly arranged by fathers or male elders of the families. In Sindh, trend of exchange marriage is very common among Muslim tribes such as Syed, Baloch, Jokhayo, Jamali, Brohi and Kapri whereas it doesn't exist in Hindu families. Exchange marriages are also major cause to keep the inherited property (land) within the family possession without letting it go outside the family. In case there is no male relative of a female within the family relatives, then she is forced to remain unmarried (by taking vow to marry with the Holy Quran) to prevent distribution of family inheritance. The parents therefore mostly prefer to wed their daughters from where they can get daughter in law for their son in return. Parents declare exchange marriages when their children are very young so that they are mentally prepared with whom they are getting married. It was stated that the first marriage among the males is arranged with cousin, whereas the second marriage can be done with the choice of boy if he wish to do that. FGD participants of women group at district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) shared that extra marital affairs of their husbands were also acceptable (by few of the women) to them as they can be divorced by their husbands if they interfere in such affairs. In district Mansehra trend of exchange marriages was not common.

4.11 Perception of domestic violence against women

Domestic violence against women is found in many forms of physical abuse in Pakistan. This includes burning of women with kerosene oil or gasoline and acid throwing prevalent in urban areas as well as rural areas. In such acts both male spouse and in-laws are also found to be involved. According to Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP) report 2015, a study conducted by a private organization reported over 15 acid attack cases in Bahawalpur from January till June 2004, of which two victims died while others suffered acute injuries, including permanent loss of vision. Around 400 women fall victim to acid burns each year, often inflicted by their husbands or in laws. And during the last 10 years, 15,000 cases had been reported throughout the country.

The communities interacted in the project areas during MTR expressed zero tolerance to domestic violence against women. According to them men should not lay hands upon women and perpetrate violence at any cost and they do not accept such acts. One of the women during FGD at Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab

Shah) shared that situation has changed significantly and “nowadays women beat their husbands”. Whereas men also have the same stance that women shouldn’t be beaten, as beating results in death and ultimately destroy the family relations and at the end husband has to suffer more. One of the men stated that “violence is not acceptable because it impacts the children development process”. But when group of boys at Sakrand were asked about the DV, they shared that violence is common on petty matters and exists in every household. When asked explicitly, they said violence at any cost should not be encouraged but when probed further, they were of the view that sometimes it is justified women doesn’t comply with men’s order. The group quoted Council of Islamic Ideology’s (CII) statements in mentioning the limits of beating their wives as well as reference to the Holy Quran Surah-e-Nisa. They stated unemployment is also a major cause of domestic violence. Meanwhile group of men at the same village shared that if a husband goes in search of labour and he don’t find a job on that day, then he beats his wife in frustration and distress. However, when women were asked that in what situations it is permitted to lay hands by males on women, they mentioned, adultery, use of abusive language, aggressive behaviour with husband and elders and wearing of revealing cloths often provoke males to perpetrate DV. Another participant of women group shared that “women have responsibility to take care for her husband, to cook food for him when he returns from labour whole day and if a wife does not do this then it is right of a husband to beat her. In district Mirpurkhas, MTR team findings on DV is not different from Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah). During FGD with boys at village Wadal Shah, the participants generally said that men should not lay hands upon women. Interestingly, to them corporal punishment of students by teachers is considered right. They further shared that people who are drug addicts or using locally produced alcohol called Tharra, often beat their children and wife. In some instances when husband enquires from wife why she had not cooked the meal on time, then exchange of harsh words turn into violence. Accordingly to them fear of beating sometimes encourage women to complete the household chores on time. Most of the males admitted that women do more labour if compared with men, but if such household chores are completed on time then there is no reason of violence.

In district Mansehra, during interaction with group of men at village Khwaja Khel, UC Buffa, they shared that a woman itself is enemy of another woman. All the domestic violence cases are related to women conflicts, which incite men to lay hands and promote violence at their homes. They further shared that drug addiction and poverty are another major causes of domestic violence. One of the participants was Assistant Professor and he shared that he has seen some illiterate women beating their men in some households. The group realized that the common form of violence that exists in their community is domestic violence whether in the form of a slap or abuse. But in some cases, this form of violence is not considered as violence, and is considered as just a minor issue. It was admitted that DV exists, even if the woman is independent. While one of the participants said that it is allowed for a man to beat woman if she attempt to change her religion. FGD with women group at the same village highlighted that men verbally abuse their wives and daughters. During FGD with men’s group at Faridabad of Battal, they mentioned that they generally do not support DV, but when they were explicitly asked then sizeable majority of the participants shared that if women cross limits then she should be beaten as a punishment. However, majority of them shared that religion does not permit violence against women.

4.12 Social Actions to reduce GBV by organization / activist/ Institution

The co-applicants of the action organized community groups by involving men and women, boys and girls to create awareness about VAWG issues, both from a legal but also a religious point of view. The groups had been trained on relevant laws and guidelines so that they can reach out to rights holders, protect the vulnerable and can be the first point of contact for survivors of GBV, liaison with service providers for GBV response services. It was learnt that the community groups have information of at least one organization, activist or Government Department that deal GBV.

In district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah), majority of the respondents were aware about the Women Complaint Cell (WCC) working in their district and they knew Ms Zaibunissa (Police Officer) and appreciated the active role played by her in solving the VAW cases. At village Attur Jokhio of UC Chanaser –I, Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) participants of boys group shared that people usually prefer to get their issues dealt by notables of village or community leaders. If the cases are not resolved by the notable, then those are filed in the courts. Whereas group leaders who have attended the trainings by co-applicant SAPPK staff, they quoted SSSF (Shah Sachal Sami Foundation), Aurat Foundation, Aurat Development Organization and CDF (Community Development Foundation). Whereas in district Mirpurkhas, the

participants knew that complaints can be dropped in the complaint box installed by SAPPK in the village, who can facilitate the process of resolving their problems.

In District Mansehra, most of the male participants were aware that co-applicant KK helps GBV survivors in addition to similar services offered by other NGOs in the area, such as Aurat Foundation, Sungi. Two of the participants mentioned that they had referred two GBV cases to KK facilitation Centre. Likewise, those employed with the co-applicant KK's Community Facilitation Centres and Chairman of village councils were also aware about the referral pathways. It was also revealed that majority of participants in all the three districts who were aware about referral pathways or any service for GBV survivors, were male, and women comparatively less aware about the referral services available to them.

4.13 Role of Jirga / Panchayat

A traditional Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) system commonly known as Jirga (a panel of elders) is the supreme forum in a Pakhtun society to settle disputes not only between individuals but tribes and families. It represents a formal traditional institution of Justice, which is practiced in the Pashtuns society from the time immemorial. In Sindh and Punjab such traditional ADR system is called Panchayat. Members of the Jirga or Panchayat once used to be the tribal chieftains, nobles and notables of the society, scholars and elders with good repute in the locality. In Sindh the Panchayat is patronized or run by feudal lords and politicians. In Sindh Jirga system is declared unlawful, illegal, and against the provisions of the constitution and law of the land. Whereas Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province introduced reforms to this traditional justice system by setting up the Dispute Resolution Council (DRC) and has modernized the Jirga by providing support from the concerned police and including women representative with good repute. It has been observed that over the last many years, the traditional Jirga system has gradually lost its sanctity after some infamous leaders took decision that violated the basic human rights. It is expected that the gradual change in the structure of Jirga will result losing people's confidence in it and people will opt going to the police or adopting other legal ways of addressing conflicts. The MTR participants in Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) district shared that people still use to approach landlords/feudal in times of such situation and get their issues resolved, because landlords have stronghold in the society due to their relations with politicians and local district administration. Whereas in KP, majority of the respondents stated that Jirga system is acceptable but these days many people are not satisfied by the Jirga's decisions, and now they prefer to go to the local courts, because Jirga decision are often gender insensitive. One of the participants at village Faridabad of UC Battal, shared that "Jirga hardly takes decisions in the favour of women".

4.14 Perception about Media

Media can play an effective role in minimizing domestic violence against women. It can play a lead role in the society's to fight violence against women. As media is the eye, ear and limbs of the society they could help a great deal in mitigating violence against women.

Media expose and generate awareness against society's ills and evils, therefore their role should be made more effective. For example media needs to be more aware about sensitivities to the causes related to violence against women. Many women said that the media coverage of especially cases of rape or other brutality is additional assault of women victims, if media is insensitive of using pictures for reporting, publishing names, and not ensuring privacy of sensitive issues, which can make women victims more vulnerable. According to participants they have observed that news coverage of cases of violence against women were often made sensational, exploitative, and with lack serious analysis. However, recently media coverage and depictions of sexual assault and domestic violence has started changing and most of the respondents expressed substantive trust on the approached by media for case of violence against women.

In all the districts of the action, media is generally quoted to have supportive role in raising voice of the poor by highlighting their issues. The issues brought in limelight took attention of the authorities concerned and were resolved on priority basis. In Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mirpurkhas districts, the respondents shared that they became aware about minimum age of marriage (18 as per Child Marriage Restraint Act) and they got this awareness through TV programs. It was learnt that men usually watch private Pakistani news channels ARY, Geo, Sama, KTN and Sindh TV whereas women used to watch Indian drama channels, Azi TV, Sony, Star Plus, Programs like Saaf Dhan and CID. Whereas in Mansehra, news channels ARY News, Geo, and PTV were found popular among male respondents meanwhile in women besides aforementioned channels, Star Plus and A Plus were watched for dramas. Apart from the

constrictive role of media, it was also noticed that mainstream media is now promoting commercials, dram serial and other morning shows that discourage dowry and gender based violence. Few respondent girls shared that in the drama serials, they think that daughter in-law should learn how to effectively deal with mother-in-law (Saas) to avoid family politics. Similarly, male respondents shared that local media journalists are corrupt and they first blackmail poor people and ask them for bribe to publish their issue. One of the participants in Mansehra district stated that "People may report the loss of their chicken but they won't allow reporting case of GBV".

4.15 Role of religious leaders

Religious leaders have considerable power and influence in Pakistan, which is one of the reasons that co-applicants have engaged progressive male religious leaders to employ religious arguments to challenge perceived gender roles and stereotypes that restrict their mobility in the public, and prevent them to be part of decision-making processes within their families.

In MTR male participants at village Faridabad and Khawaja Khel of UC-Battal and Baffa of district Mansehra stated that some religious leaders now talk about women's rights (Maulana Furqan, Abdul Shakoor, and Qari Imtiaz and Pir M. Khan). There were many sermons delivered on Women's Rights to Inheritance (WRI) by religious leader in the mosques. The co-applicant (KK) has constituted committee of religious leaders who were sensitized on women's rights. These religious leaders were mobilized and convinced to fix one Friday out of four Fridays each month dedicate to highlight women's rights issues during sermon and how to prevent issues of GBV using religious arguments.

Not all but many female participants (women and girls) in district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mansehra were aware of the importance of marriage (Nikah) registration with the Government data based department. They stated that it's the proof of the marriage and divorce (Khula) for women is easier if they have register their marriages. They were aware of who registers marriages (Nikah) in their area. Whereas in district Mirpurkhas, the interacted participants both male and female were belonging to Hindu community, who knew religious leaders (pandits / mahraj) of their community who solemnizes the marriages. However, participants shared that their religious leaders never talked about women rights in sermons. MTR team also held KII with mahraj as well in Kot Ghulam Mohammad Tehsil. In the KII, it was found that the informant has attended the training on women's rights but he was not aware about Hindu Marriage bill which encompasses the women's rights.

4.16 Role of Marriage Registrars

In rural areas, very often marriage (Nikah) registrars and marriage solemnizers (Nikah Khwan) perform both roles. The staff of co-applicants sensitized the marriage solemnizers by the to seek the consent of the bride and the bridegroom, before solemnizing a marriage in order to comply with the Anti-Women Practices Act 2011 and Child Marriage Restraint Act. The marriage solemnizers also oversee the filling out of the Nikahnama (marriage certificate) to prevent family members from striking off or leaving blank key clauses (such as the right to divorce, or conditions for the marriage) that grant the bride some degree of protection. The marriage solemnizers were also made aware that at the time of the wedding, they can also make a reasonable assessment if the bride is below minimum age by looking at the Computerised Identity Card date of birth to discourage child/early marriages.

In the MTR, one of interacted participants in district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) at village Dalel Dero, UC Sakrand, stated that 6 months back a religious leader (marriage solemnizer) was solemnizing marriage of 8 years bride and old man was groom. The community group instantly reported it to police and stopped that marriage and the marriage solemnizer was jailed. This action was done with the efforts of social activists training by the co-applicant's staff. Whereas, majority of the participants in Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) shared that in the past marriage solemnizers get girls married off without verification of their age as they do not had identity cards. Even 17 years old girls were married and their marriages were solemnized by religious leaders. One of the participants of boys group at Asghar Colony, Sakrand said that "Mothers teach their daughter that they have to say yes at the time of Nikah (marriage solemnization). In Dalel Dero, participant stated one instance where marriage solemnizer refused to solemnize the marriage of a girl, but the marriage took place anyway using other marriage solemnizer, which shows that influential families can still violate the marriage law. Similarly, Chairman of boys' group shared that most of the marriage solemnizers are not well sensitized on solemnization of marriage because

they never validate the age of girls and boys and even never confirm whether previous Nikkha was intact. They never refused to perform the wedding (Nikah).” During discussion with women group in village Attur Jokhio and Mehran Colony, it was revealed that majority of the Muslim women have never seen the marriage certificate (Nikah Nama) and only verbal witness is taken at the time of marriage ceremony. While, Hindu and Christian women knew from where to get the marriage registration, because they quoted name of a pandit /mahraj and pastor of their areas who help issuing the marriage certificate. To them it’s hard to get CNIC if a woman has no marriage certificate. However, it was learnt that there wasn’t a trend of marriage registration in the community from religious minorities. In district Mansehra one such instance of ECM was also shared by the group participants at district Mansehra where marriage solemniser refused to solemnize the marriage of a girl and boy, but their parents brought the fake documents/birth certificate and asked the marriage solemniser to solemnize the marriage.

4.17 Role of police officers

The Police has a key role to play with regards to VAWG. The police can choose to categorize a death as simple murder or as the complex act of honour killing and affect whether the perpetrator gets sentenced in accordance with law or not. According to research by the National Commission on Status of Women (NCSW), the police discourages VAWG survivors to report their complaints. The Police reporting and investigation mechanisms are full of flaws, resulting in victimization and harassment of women while also denying them justice at various levels. To address these problems, the co-applicants engaged the Police Department about the importance of behaving in a gender sensitive manner and how to raise their awareness about new laws and policies.

During the MTR team, in districts Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mirpurkhas generally the role of police department was not portrayed in a positive way. However, many of the respondents were aware about WCC (Women Complaint Cells) established by KP Police on request of co-applicant (KK) and appreciated the role of Ms Zaibunissa, the in-charge of women complaint cell, in solving the cases related to VAW. Whereas in Mansehra, the respondents shared that police cooperates in GBV cases. They viewed that appointment of women police officers is good initiative for dispensing immediate legal action against the culprits. Women feel more at home in explaining their issues to women police officers. At the same time some participants of village Faridabad and Khawaja Khel of UC-Battal and Baffa stated that police do not play a very positive role in addressing cases including GBV. However, the participants appreciated KP Government for bring reforms in public institutions including Police Department. The participants lauded right to information (RTI) Act and by applying this act certain issues related to information about infrastructure development, health and education budgets got resolved.

4.18 Role of Revenue officers in inheritance related matters

In Sindh generally right to inheritance is not given to women by their families due to which women never approach revenue officer for registering their complaints to get share of inheritance. In Hindu families right to Inheritance for girls is not a part of their culture, but daughters are given significant share of livestock at the time of wedding in addition to dowry which includes crockery, utensils, household appliances, and furniture.

The Revenue Officer (Patwari) is a Government official responsible for management of inheritance related matters and plays an important role to ensure women and girls get their due share according to the law relevant to Muslim faith. Few of respondents (male and female) were of opinion that Revenue Officers only help male heirs. They also mentioned that girls were not really given share in inheritance in the form of land or property but dowry as compensation for inheritance. However, in few target villages the process has been started to give the share of inheritance to daughters. Moreover, during FGD with girls and women in village Khawaja Khel revealed that women themselves do not claim their right to inheritance from their parents to avoid conflict within family. It was learnt that due to societal pressure women do not claim the right and it is considered against the local traditions. As a result most of the girls withdrew their right to inheritance in favour of their brothers against very minor compensation.

Since the country law allows women of Muslim faith to have the right to get share in inheritance, the co-applicants of the action sensitized the Revenue Officers in the target districts to ensure inclusion of female heirs in the process to get inheritance when their male family members initiate the paperwork for transfer of inheritance on their names. In Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) one of the group participants shared

that few years back, a Revenue Officer visited their village when one women filed case for right to inheritance after her husband's death (8-10 years old case). The husband had two marriages and the first wife did not wanted to give the inheritance share to the second wife who was from another community. The revenue officer helped the second wife in getting her right to share in inheritance. In Mansehra district, one of the participants at village Khawaja Khel shared that two sisters filed a case of inheritance which is under process. Another case of a woman whose husband died filed a case of inheritance and successfully got share in the inheritance.

4.19 Role of Lady Health Worker (LHW)

Lady Health Workers (LHWs) are Government employees under the Health Ministry who play a critical role in reaching out to women in backward areas who cannot go out of their homes without permission of male elders due to social norms, to provide them with basic health services (mostly related to reproductive health and family planning) at their homes, and also inform them about their rights as citizens. They are also useful sources of information about sensitive matters such as forced/early marriages. According to male (men and boys) respondents in district Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah), role of LHWs was only limited to administer polio drops and vaccines to children and pregnant women. Whereas when asked to women about LHWs role, they shared that LHWs share general information related to reproductive health, its complication, how to take preventive measures during pregnancy and what are their rights as women. In district Mansehra, the participants shared that LHWs gives information about the maternal health, SRHR and menstrual hygiene management. Although girls get to know about menstrual cycle in schools, the LHWs does not provide them with critical knowledge about menstrual hygiene management. It was shared by majority of the participants in all the three districts LHWs have started dissemination of information related to health related complication of Early Child Marriages (ECMs) among the women groups which are organized by the co-applicants. This type of knowledge has helped the parents to discourage early child marriages in their villages.

4.20 Partner engagement with the community groups

According to community groups in district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mirpurkhas, at least two members of the groups have attended trainings on women rights whereas youth has attended training on positive masculinity. They recalled few messages delivered to them in the trainings. Whereas, other community group members have attended public awareness events called 'Awami Aghai Kath (Peoples' Awareness Programme)' where they were given awareness about women rights. Whereas in Mansehra community groups comprised of men and women reported that they have attended trainings on masculinity and they recalled few messages delivered in the training. Some participants also had attended training conducted by other local NGOs named Sungi and Community World Service Asia (both NCA partners for emergency response) on women rights, conflict resolution and Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR).

4.21 Attitudes and practices regarding marriage registration

It was also learnt that many marriages are not documented but are done on verbal consent. In such situations girls are only informed at the time of their marriage (Nikah) ceremony, and at that event she is not in a position to decline it. The respondents were of the view that they do not need documentation when the marriages happen within their families. One of the group member who was a teacher was aware from where to seek the marriage registration certificate.' One of the young male participants at Asghar Colony, Sakrand said that "Mothers teach their daughters that they have to say yes at the time of Nikah (marriage solemnization). Whereas discussion with the girls and women revealed that majority of them have never seen the marriage certificate (Nikah Nama). Meanwhile in Mansehra, women participants said that they have seen marriage certificate but they are unaware about the marriage registration. They were also aware about the importance of marriage registration as proof of marriage, who register marriages in their areas, and in case of petition for divorce (Khula) women can use this important piece of document.

In district Mirpurkhas and Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) Hindu and Christian women knew from where to get the marriage registration. They also quoted names of pandit /mahraj (Hindu religious leaders) and pastors in their areas who can issue marriage certificate. To them it is hard to get CNIC if a woman has no marriage certificate. However, it was learnt that there wasn't trend of marriage registration in the community from religious minorities.

4.22 GBV Response services

Women who have experienced GBV have multiple and complex needs, which includes medical care, safe accommodation, psychosocial counselling, police protection and/or legal advice. Therefore, an effective response to GBV requires a comprehensive set of services from the community and Government. Since it is virtually impossible for a single organization to provide all services in the required quality and specialization, a multi-sectoral response that coordinates the services by all relevant service providers helps to ensure the availability of comprehensive support for survivors of GBV. In Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mirpurkhas, majority of the respondents except key informants have never seen the referral pathway documents. However, they had extensive knowledge about Women Complaint Cell. They shared that in such cases, courts, parliamentarians could be approached. Some of the participants shared SSSF (Shah Sachal Sami Foundation), VDO and Aurat Foundation and Media can assist women in times of such situation. Furthermore, in district Mirpurkhas, the participants knew that complaint can be dropped in the complaint box installed by co-applicant SAPPAAK staff in the village. In District Mansehra, participants were aware with co-applicant KK which helps GBV survivors. A few of the participants were aware about services or facilities for GBV survivors. They stated Aurat Foundation, Sungi and KK for survivor's assistance. Two of the participants associated with co-applicant KK in community facilitation had referred two GBV cases to KK. The village council of Faridabad in UC Battal had also referred two cases of VAW to KK.

4.23 Media consumption (radio and TV)

Access to media (TV and radio) is largely limited to urban areas and mostly rural men and women in general have very little access. Media can play very constructive role in the society when it transmit positive messages in the public to create demand for change. In addition, media exposure can increase legitimacy and clout within the community. It can also help to promote the right things on right time and gives a real as well as strong aspect of the world about what is right and wrong and express how we can store and distribute views.

Media landscape in Pakistan has changed quite recently from state run Pakistan Television Corporation to numerous private TV channels, which is slowly becoming preferred choice for more and more women from educated urban middle class. In urban communities of Sakrand/ Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mansehra most of the respondents shared that they have TV and in their view media plays a supportive role in highlighting the issues of society. The issues brought in limelight takes attention of authorities concerned and then sooner it is resolved. People also became aware about minimum age for marriage (18 years as per Child Marriage Restraint Act) through TV programs. It was learnt that men usually watch private Pakistani news channels ARY, Geo, Sama, KTN and Sindh TV whereas women used to watch Indian drama channels, Azi TV, Sony , Star Plus, Programs like Saaf Dhan and CID. Whereas in Mansehra, TV is popular among the communities and most popular channels watched are Geo News, ARY News, PTV, Star Plus and A Plus. Media in their view is gender sensitive. FM radio was not usually listened in almost all the villages visited in both Sindh and KP provinces.

4.24 Perception about masculinity

Gender stereotypes suggest that men are usually tough and women are usually tender. There was a correlation observed between construction of masculinity by the family and society while being raised as a boy and its manifestation in the form of violence in the later stages of their lives. Men are raised perceiving that it was their natural right to be superior in comparison to women and they ensure that they are respected and their needs were given priority. In the MTR, rigid notions of masculinity were observed. The findings shows that women have more rigid notions of masculinity. The MTR team through scale of statements, sought the responses of participants so that their sentiment, opinion and experience around masculinity can be collected.

In district Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mirpurkhas, it was revealed that among boys and men rigid notions of masculinity prevail although they were willing to help with cooking, cleaning and bringing up children if needed. One of the participants, shared that "men do not cry" but he can cry internally. If he cries publically, than he is criticized by the people that he should not weep in front of women. Participants from boys group at village Sher Shah of UC Mir Ghulam Hussain, district Mirpurkhas disagreed that a real man is violent and controlling but they said that men cannot cry. They agreed that a good man can take care of his children but disagreed that a real man helps with cleaning of the house, but this can only be done if the wife is not at home. Whereas during discussion with girls in the same village it was revealed that before

marriage men/ boys used to cook meal but after marriage this responsibility is taken over by wife. The group of the girls said that, "I'll never let my brother wash the dishes if I'm well; if I'm unwell then he will do it. I do it because I'm a girl."

In district Mansehra, perception regarding masculinity more or less remained same in interviewed communities. During discussion with a group of boys in UC Battle, it was learnt that around 90% of the participants think that men should not cook or clean, only 10% shared that they can. According to the group men do not weep, as it makes them weak and people will make fun of them. Moreover, according to them men can look after children but can't cook. Majority of the participants of women and girls groups thought that assisting women in housekeeping or cleaning by men is considered bad. However, there is nothing bad if men assist women in taking care of the younger child while she is engaged in cooking meal. Some women thought that men rarely remain at home at day time so how they can assist women at home. According to them men are responsible to bring things required at home and women is responsible to use those things and prepare meal. One of the participants of girls group shared that, "men can wash clothes when they are alone but not when they are with family."

5. Key Informants/ Stakeholders/ Duty bearers' response

Revenue Officer: Akram Soomro –at Kot Ghulam Muhammad (KGM): This revenue officer was gender sensitized and was aware about women's rights. VCDO – partner of co-applicant SAPPK referred 4 cases of right to inheritance to this revenue office and those were resolved and women were given their right to have share to inheritance. He shared that division of property is the responsibility of the revenue office whereas authority of getting possession of the property is given to civil court. To him law of the land is quite in favour of women but it is in confrontation with religion. Religion does not favour women rights. In Hindu religion concept of right to inheritance does not exist, whereas in Muslim the law varies from one sect to other, Shia has different connotation of that law and Sunni has different. Lawyers' forum do not make efforts, as result the forum lingers on the cases and do not take up the cases on priority basis.

Religious Leader: Keshave Lal at KGM, district Mirpurkhas This religious leader has been associated with co-applicant SAPPK and has attended trainings on women rights. During discussion he shared that Ex-President Musharraf introduced joint electoral system in Pakistan, which remained in favour of minorities, because election contestant was compelled to come at poor peoples' door step to ask for votes, which was previously not a case. Media was given freedom during his time and opening of more TV channels raised awareness among common people about their rights and social issues. He further shared that initially parents do not consulted their daughters for marriage, but after sensitization process started by co-applicant SAPPK staff in the villages, now community in general and parents in particular have realized that they should consult their daughters when deciding about their marriage. He believed that exchange marriage is done as a security for each other's daughters. He further stated that there is no pressure of dowry and it is only given as per financial status of parents. VAW is common on petty matters, but now it has been decreased after the awareness raising of community groups.

Religious Leader: Hafiz Hussain Bux at Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah): This religious leader stated that women should be cooperative with their husbands. They should maintain purdah (veil) and get education. Regarding dowry he gave example of his own family, where his son-in-law demanded cash amount so dowry according to him has relevance and importance as a tradition. For boys ideal age for marriage is between 22-25 years and for girls it is between 18-20 years. As per discussion, the leader has never performed forced marriage, and he admitted that exchange marriage is common though it's against Islam but it is practiced largely in our society. According to him DV is common in low income families and males have low tolerance level which results into violence. In Islam there is no restriction of women's employment. He stated that due to poverty, people are not ready to listen good message. So until poverty is not eliminated, instances of violence cannot be reduced. He has attended meetings on KaroKari (Honour Killing) by Takhleeq Foundation.

Religious Leader: Qazi Wasi-ur-Rehamn at Mansehra: during interview with this religious leader, he shared that "Women can work in any field, and there is no specified field in which men can work and women cannot. Men can be engineer and so can be women, men are pilot and so are women nowadays. He further shared that the common perception in our society assume that women are responsible for household

chores, such as caring of children and cooking meal, whereas children are responsible for supporting their parents and getting education. In our society women's mobility is restricted, but currently women are seen in market buying household items and shopping clothes. Domestic violence is common due to various reasons in the society like poverty, unemployment and lack of education or awareness. Minimum age for marriage is 18 years, underage marriage have social, physical and economic consequences. In religion, there is zero tolerance on violence. Has never performed marriage of underage boys or girls. Though it was not a practice to discuss women rights topic in the sermon, but now he include women rights issues in his sermon.

Meeting with District Watch Group

The DWG is comprised of different stakeholders, which include legal fraternity (members of bar council), religious leaders of different faiths, CSOs in the target areas, concerned representatives of Government Departments (police, social welfare, and revenue officers), teachers, and journalists. The purpose of this forum was to provide platform to concerned stakeholders who can jointly strengthen efforts of co-applicant SAPPK to do advocacy work with concerned Government Departments to address GBV issues in the target communities of two districts (Mirpurkhas and Benazirabad), where EU project is implemented.

The DWG members reported that women rights awareness has increased among the women groups at grassroots level in their target areas. Women now make efforts to speak for their rights when their rights are violated by the family member or the communities. The established complain referral system in target areas is working well and victims are able access legal aid services for cases of forced marriages and inheritance. With support of DWG, 3 cases of inheritance were resolved in Mirpurkhas by co-applicant SAPPK to enable women to get possession of inherited land. This is good example of advocacy work being done by different stakeholders who are members of the DWG. To date a total of 213 cases have been identified out of which 113 cases of early marriage, domestic violence and right to inheritance are resolved through community mobilization in Mirpurkhas district by co-applicant SAP-PK. A media cell has also been established by the co-applicant SAPPK community groups to monitor and document cases of domestic violence. As a result reporting of number of GBV cases related to domestic violence has increased from 20-40 this year.

One of the advocate in DWG shared that the main cause of the child marriage is ineffective and non-responsive birth registration system. The birth registration for children, especially girls is never prioritized, which gives room for manipulation of the age of the child/girls at the time of marriage.

It was also reported that communication gape exist among the DWG members, which needs to be bridged by creating WhatsApp group to share updates and case stories from field. It was advised that the monitoring and implementation of the pro women laws in the project areas should be given priority. The DWG also considered the need to sensitize members of political parties on women's rights who are ignorant about the gender issues. This type advocacy helps to have more women friendly legislation.

Some members of DWG were not clear about the terms of reference and scope of work (SoW) of the DWG. It was advised to form a small groups of DWG members who should draft TOR and SoW for the DWG.

NCA is supporting another GBV Project in district Mirpurkhas in areas different from the EU supported action areas, through another local partner Baahn Beli (BB) with financial support of Church of Sweden (COS). This local partner has also established parallel DWG with same purpose and objectives and its members also participate in each other's meeting. This project also compliments the efforts made by co-applicant SAPPK for the GBV project supported by EU. During discussion a need was consider to merge both groups into one to avoid overlap and to effectively address issues of GBV through on group.

Meeting with Khwendo Kor's Area Coordination Committee (KACC)

NCA team held a meeting with Khwendo Kor's Area Coordination Committee (KACC). It was shared by the KACC members that they have conducted two initial meetings. In first meeting it was advised to draft the Tore and those were later on aligned with KK's generic KACC model. KACC members are contributing to tackle issues at district level, recently they took a female university professor's issue who was harassed and was not given due position though she deserved and fulfilled the criteria of higher ranked position in

the university. KACC members have been very active to highlight women's issues and to detect and prevent WAVG in district Mansehra.

6. Constraints/ Challenges

Following were the major constraints or challenges faced during MTR:

- The MTR was done during the cotton picking season in Sindh, therefore, women and men were engaged in the harvesting of the crop, whereas in district Mirpurkhas, majority of the target communities belong to religious minorities (Hindu) and they had their religious festival Janam Ashtami. They were busy with celebrations of the festival, however, co-applicants managed to arrange FGDs with the groups.
- In KP, availability of duty bearers for KII remained a challenge. Similarly Revenue Officers (Patwari) were engaged in revenue officials' (tehsildaar) meetings, therefore, they could not spare the required amount of time for the meeting.
- Majority of the youth in the targeted areas was daily wage labour in the nearby market. Availability of boys, that played active role in the project activities, remained minimal.
- It is generally observed that NGOs receiving money from foreign donors and working for human rights are perceived as "foreign/ western agent".
- Similarly space for civil society organisations/INGOs is shrinking in general and actors are often intimidated, vilified or even banned.
- Lack of knowledge among local community members about where to seek services, even in places where services do exist, women can face stereotypical attitudes from service providers.
- It is generally been reported that prosecution rates for domestic violence and sexual offences were low, with women frequently too afraid to report the crimes or being intimidated into withdrawing complaints. Having sensitive nature of MTR topics related to SGBV, women were reluctant in sharing the information. They were not open to share any incident of GBV that had occurred with them or any known women in their community. FGD facilitator had to probe a lot for getting information from the community especially women.
- It was observed that low educational attainment, unemployment and a family history of violence were positively associated with acceptance of violence. Moreover, boys particularly from District Shaheed Benazirabad (Nawab Shah) and Mansehra were justifying the violence on women by quoting CII's recommendation to parliament for legislation that "Husband can beat his wife' and 'anti-women' stance of the CII permitted violence against women that contributed to an increase in crimes against the gender.
- In the project intervention villages, education facilities for girls were either not available and if available then were understaffed coupled with scarcity of infrastructure which results in a high dropout of girl students. Unavailability of education facilities for girls in the villages' results in early marriage of girls as parents opined that girls have no other work to do at home and security issues may possibly arise for their young daughters thus their marriage is considered to be the only solution to all of those issues. If some girls could manage to go to schools the after grade 8th or 10th then many parents tend to curtail the education of their girls and marry them off, due to fear of exposure to sexual violence and abuse encountered.
- It was observed that majority of the communities are relatively slow in advocacy and opting rights based approach strategies.
- Local community groups expect long term commitment from co-applicant SAPPK to work in their areas on GBV issues. They are concerned that it takes more than a year to mobilize communities and to gain their trust and when communities start understanding the project objectives and its impact on their life it is time to close the project activities.
- Due to illiteracy dealing with domestic violence cases especially among minority groups is a big challenge. Illiterate females are scared to report incidents of domestic violence against their male family

members (husband, brother, in-laws) to village community groups because of severe backlash. The consequences of reporting such incidents could be divorce which they cannot dare to risk as they could be abandoned by their family. Moreover there is no institutional or structural mechanism to support the survivor if a woman is divorced or victimized.

- High profile cases of domestic violence are not given due attention by the Police Department due to expected backlash of transfer to other areas or physical threats.

7. Recommendation/ Area for improvements

- Co-applicant SAPPK should help District Watch Group (DWG) to prepare bylaws/TORs, list of permanent members of DWG, and option to rotate the chair of DWG on quarterly or six monthly basis to ensure sustainability.
- The co-applicant SAPPK should advise DWG member organizations to depute a focal staff who knows purpose of DWG and is able to assist in advocacy work related to GBV.
- At present there are two DWGs established and managed by two NCA partners SAPPK (for the EU project) and Baanhn Beli (for Church of Sweden project). NCA advised both partners to meet and agree on having one DWG in district Mirpurkhas as it creates confusion among communities and district Government Departments to attend two different meetings for same purpose.
- The co-applicant SAPPK should help local community groups to link with other CSOs and Government Departments to access legal support for GBV related cases in their areas.
- The co-applicant SAPPK staff should provide more information and awareness to its staff and target communities on newly approved 'Hindu Marriage Bill' so that communities can benefit from this legislation.
- Communication gap among DWG members exists. It can be bridged by ensuring regular interaction by creating WhatsApp group, sharing updates and case studies from field.
- The co-applicant KK is recommended to conduct capacity building training of field staff especially female staff of Mansehra district on gender sensitivity and GBV issues.
- The co-applicant SAPPK should do advocacy at the provincial level to pressurize the state to ensure that officials of concerned departments that help DWG in addressing GBV issues are retained in the district for longer period of time to see impact of public private partnership initiatives and provide support mechanism to treat cases of GBV survivors.

8. Annexes