

# **End of Project Evaluation Report**

## **Accountable Resource Governance of Oil and Gas Sector in Tanzania for Social Economic Development 2014-2016**

---

**Norwegian Church Aid- Tanzania**

*Prepared by*

*Moses Kulaba & George Gathigi, Ph.D., Consultants*

April 2017

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>LIST of acronyms</b> .....	<b>v</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>vi</b>
<b>BACKGROUND</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Objective of the Project.....	2
<b>objectives of the Evaluation</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>methodology</b> .....	<b>2</b>
Evaluation Sample.....	3
<b>Limitations of the Evaluation</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>FINDINGS: PROJECTS SYNTHESIS</b> .....	<b>4</b>
Programme Design.....	5
Programme Relevance.....	6
Partnerships and Engagement (FBOs/Religious Leaders, networks, platforms, village committees) .....	7
<i>Selection of partners</i> .....	7
<i>Decision making within partnership</i> .....	7
<i>Success of the partnership model</i> .....	7
<i>Engaging Religions Leaders</i> .....	8
<i>Degree of partner coordination and involvement with other natural resource governance platforms, networks and organization's in Tanzania (national and local)</i> .....	9
<i>What mechanisms did the project use and how effective have they been in engaging program stakeholders.</i> .....	9
<i>Achievements by religious leaders</i> .....	10
Programme Effectiveness .....	10
<i>Achievement of objectives</i> .....	10
<i>Summary of Output, Baseline, Target and Achievements</i> .....	11
<i>Clarity of the strategy</i> .....	15
<i>Assumptions and risks and their impact on the strategy; and how they have been managed</i> .....	15
Project Efficiency .....	16
<i>To what extent have the resources been utilized based on the project targets?</i> .....	17
<i>Budget Distribution by partner</i> .....	18
<i>Budget Share by Activity</i> .....	18
Project Accountability .....	19
Results of the Project .....	19
<i>Increased participation in public resources management</i> .....	19
<i>Oil and gas policy</i> .....	19
<i>Economic justice from oil and gas operations</i> .....	20
<i>Mobilization</i> .....	20

<i>Knowledge, Skills and Capacity</i> .....	20
<i>Unintended effects of the project</i> .....	21
<i>Change in target groups</i> .....	21
<i>Quality of training and extent to which capacity of citizens was built to engage in accountability</i> .....	22
<i>Extent of influence of PETs Committees and paralegals on local accountability</i> .....	22
<i>Number of people have benefitted from project activities</i> .....	23
Project Outcomes.....	23
Project Sustainability .....	24
NCA's Added Value.....	25
Challenges.....	25
<i>Programme Conceptualisation and Implementation</i> .....	25
<i>Wide Project Coverage</i> .....	26
<i>Gaps in Project Document Design</i> .....	26
<i>Absence of Theory of change</i> .....	26
<i>Gaps in Adhering to Timelines:</i> .....	26
<i>Conflicting Models in Community Banking</i> .....	27
<i>Structure</i> .....	27
<i>Communication Gaps</i> .....	27
<i>Trainings Gaps</i> .....	28
<i>Improper selection of villages</i> .....	28
<i>Resources</i> .....	28
<i>Challenge working with Costal Communities</i> .....	28
Lessons Learned.....	29
<i>Proper contextual understanding of the area and subject is required for proper project design and implementation</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of project design documents</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of articulating of the TOC that</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of risk identification and mitigation measures in project design</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of Managing Ambitions</i> .....	29
<i>Importance of Participation</i> .....	30
<i>Strength in partnership</i> .....	30
<i>Strength of Multi-Level Mobilisation and Advocacy</i> .....	30
<i>Untapped Potential in Communities</i> .....	30
<i>Different Partners, different attention</i> .....	30
<i>Social values and belief systems</i> .....	31
<i>Involving women and youth</i> .....	31
<i>Complexity of oil and gas</i> .....	31
Recommendations.....	31
<i>Capacity strengthening and building</i> .....	31
<i>Projects Structure</i> .....	31
<i>Strengthening reporting, learning and communication component</i> .....	31
<i>Trainings</i> .....	32

<i>Strengthening IGAs</i> .....	32
<i>Supporting Paralegals and PETS</i> .....	32
<i>Resources</i> .....	32
<i>Value for money evaluation</i> .....	33
<i>Sustainability and exit plan</i> .....	33

## LIST OF ACCRONYMS

ACRONYM	NAME IN FULL
BAKWATA	Baraza la Wa Isilamu Tanzania (Muslim Council of Tanzania)
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
DIC	District Interfaith Committee
ELCT-ECD	Evangelical Lutheran Church in Tanzania-Eastern and Coastal Dioceses
FBO	Faith Based Organisation
IFC	Interfaith Committee
IGA	Income Generating Activity
ISEJIC	Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and Integrity of Creation
IR-VICOBA	Inter-Religious Village Community Banks
KKKT	Kanisa la Kiinjili la Kilutheri Tanzania
LNG	Liquidified Natural Gas
LWF	Lutheran World Federation
TEC	Tanzania Episcopal Conference
TCRS	Tanganyika Christian Refugee Service
TOC	Theory of Change
WIN	Women Interfaith Network
NCA	Norwegian Church Aid
NPA	Norwegian Peoples Aid
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for Development
NOK	Norwegian Kroners
OECD	Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development
OfD	Oil for Development

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

This is an End of Project Evaluation report for the Accountable Resource Governance of Oil and Gas Sector in Tanzania for Social Economic Development 2014-2016. The evaluation was conducted in March and April 2017 guided by six objectives which included identifying extent to which project objectives have been met; unintended achievements and constraints; reviewing whether the assumed risks had any impact during the project cycle; evaluating the added value of NCA; identifying key lessons learnt for partners and NCA and propose recommendations for future programming on natural resources management and governance

The evaluation employed mixed methods approach to collect data which was analysed and presented at the program and project levels. The data was collected through review of the project documentation both at the program level and individual partners. Evaluators visited partners in their respective districts including TEC in Mtwara, TCRS) in Kilwa, BAKWATA in Lindi and ELCT-ECD in Mafia. A sample of twelve (12) villages out of sixteen (16) villages where the project was implemented was covered. The evaluation targeted beneficiaries, coordinators, IFCs, PETs and Paralegals teams, government officers, partners' project officers and NCA officers.

The report covers specific programme evaluation areas including project design, institutional capacity, relevance, project effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, accountability, project results and outcomes, and impact in the community. The findings shows that the general performance of the programme is mixed amid various challenges. The activities under the programme and specific project were found to have made strides in various levels ranging from establishment of inter-faith committee, uniting communities and ensuing action, and changes in the communities in terms of economic empowerment, participation in decision making especially in relation to oil and gas, demanding for accountability and public expenditure tracking. Progress was noted in terms of access to justice spurred by the work of trained paralegals in the communities although their work is not optimal.

The design of the programme was found as effective to some extent but some partners have lacked the capacity to matches the projects' needs. The establishment of inter-faith committees and faith leaders presented direct access to the target population, build trust and unity in communities and helped to bridge gaps and fissures that existed in the communities. The programme was credited for creating peace and understanding among people who, hitherto, viewed themselves as different.

The programme and projects are relevant based on the identified needs. The level of effectiveness was found to vary across the different project influenced by, among others, characteristics of the target communities and the strength of implementing partners. The

efficiency levels are somehow satisfactory with notable challenges in the adherence to the timelines.

Various challenges noted including gaps in programme conceptualisation, wide project coverage, gaps in design document, absence of Theory of Change, difficulties in adhering to timeliness, conflicting Models in community banking and a structure that is somehow bureaucratic. Other challenges included gaps in communication and training, inadequate resources, and target communities characteristics that affected outcomes.

A number of lessons can be drawn from the projects. These include the importance of contextual understanding of the area and subject is required for proper project design and implementation, importance of developing comprehensive design documents at the inception, the need to articulate theory of change, and risk identification and mitigation measures in project design. Other notable lessons include the need to manage ambitions, the central role of participation, the upsides of partnership and multi-level mobilisation and advocacy, the need to consider different partners separately given their strength, and importance of involving women and youth in such programme.

A number of recommendations are made in this report. These include need for capacity strengthening and building, reconsidering the projects structure, and strengthening reporting, learning and communication components. Others recommendations include improving on trainings, strengthening IGAs, providing support to Paralegals and PETS, increasing resources, conducting value for money evaluation and developing a solid sustainability and exit plan.

# Accountable Resource Governance of Oil and Gas Sector in Tanzania for Social Economic Development Evaluation 2014

---

## BACKGROUND

Exploration for oil and gas in Tanzania began 60 years ago with the first discovery of natural gas made in 1974 at Songosongo Island and the second at Mnazi Bay in 1982. Songosongo natural gas was commercialized in 2004 and Mnazi Bay in 2006. Despite these previous discoveries, the impact on the economy has not been significant. Instead Tanzania has been greatly dependent of income from minerals. But with the 2010 exploration activities in the deep seas, which identified commercial reserves totalling 32 trillion cubic feet of natural gas, there is a great hope that revenue from a gas economy will completely transform Tanzania's economy by 2025, promoting it to an OECD-DAC middle income country.

However, Tanzania has had bad experiences with the extractive sector, particularly mining, and contracts relating to revenue collection which return very low tax revenue. This is evident in the 2008 Golden Opportunity I report that showed how Tanzania was failing to benefit significantly from gold mining. A continuation of this study, commissioned by the Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and Integrity of Creation (ISCEJIC), The One Billion Dollar Question report from 2012 goes further illustrating the vast amount of lost tax revenue that could be used to reduce poverty. The report states the importance of fair taxes in light of the future income from Tanzania's recently-discovered oil and gas. There is also a serious problem of poor governance and accountability among government officials and community representatives while residents in gold mining areas are seeing few benefits and many are being made poorer.

The project areas of Lindi, Mtwara, Kilwa and Mafia are among the areas that have remained under-developed due to poor infrastructure and social services for decades. In addition, poor performance of the main cash crop (cashew) for these areas and the mismanagement of (cashew-nut) cooperative unions has caused communities in the area to experience poverty. The key question raised by the population from the project areas is how the massive discovery of gas reserves in their area would benefit them economically and socially; taking into consideration the negative experiences of communities in other areas.

Experience has also shown the limited contribution of investors in the extractive sector to the development at the local villages, or the insufficient use of contributions by the local government leaders. For example, between 1998 and 2011, Tanzania exported gold worth \$11.3 billion, but in return, the government earned only \$450 million or 4 %, in taxes and royalties went directly to central government, and little of it was returned to the communities where these mines are located. Such instances have been one of the reasons that fuelled conflicts in Mtwara causing the death of seven people, in addition to devastation of property worth billions of shillings. These situations demonstrate the need for interventions that will prepare communities in the project area for the gas industry, including their capacity to utilize business opportunities, as well as improving governance and social services delivery for improved lives and livelihoods.

## **Objective of the Project**

The objective of the project was to strengthen the public dialogue on natural resource governance, and to contribute to poverty reduction and long term rights-based development. The project has focused on engaging religious leaders, men and women from communities in Mtwara, Lindi, Mafia and Kilwa districts where gas/ oil discoveries and exploration were made.

The four implementing partners; Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and Integrity of Creation (ISCEJIC), Tanzania Episcopal Conference (TEC), Tanganyika Christian Refugee Service (TCRS), BAKWATA and Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania – Eastern Coastal Diocese (ELCT ECD) have sought to mobilize religious leaders and community members on transparency and accountable governance, economic empowerment, gender justice and peace building through interfaith approach. The project was funded by NORAD under the global Oil for Development (OfD) scheme; 2.5 million NOK over three years.

## **OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION**

This evaluation was guided by the following objectives:

1. To identify and evaluate to what extent project objectives have been met
2. To identify and document unintended achievements and constraints
3. To review whether the assumed risks had any impact during the project cycle
4. To evaluate the added value of NCA
5. To identify key lessons learnt for partners and NCA,
6. To propose recommendations for what could be NCA's niche and added value in possible future programming on natural resources management and governance, in the oil and gas sector evaluation aims to inform the partners and Norwegian Church Aid how to proceed in the last period of the project period and thereafter

## **METHODOLOGY**

The evaluation employed mixed methods to collect data, which was analysed and presented in a main report at the program and project levels. The data was collected through review of the project documentation both at the program level and individual partners (project level). Evaluators visited the following project sites in various parts of the country.

- Tanzania Episcopal Conference (TEC) project in Mtwara district;
- Tanganyika Christian Refugee Service (TCRS) in Kilwa district;
- BAKWATA in Lindi district; and
- Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania – Eastern Coastal Diocese (ELCT ECD) also known as Kanisa la Kiinjili la Kilutheri Tanzania (KKKT).

## Evaluation Sample

The project is being implemented in 16 villages. The evaluation sample covered 12 villages out of 16 representing 75% of the total project coverage. The **villages covered** reached were.

District	Contact Person & Partner	Villages Covered
Mtwara	Fr Charity Hokororo, TEC	Madimba
		Majengo
		Nambeleka
Lindi	Mohamed Mbaruk, Cordinator-BAKWATA	Mmahumbika
		Ngapa
		Ruaha
Kilwa	Kalist Zawadi, TCRS Festo Daniel, Field Officer	Mvuji
		Kiwawa
		Rushungi
Mafia	Onesmo Mdende/Ms Agatha Lema , ELCT-ECD-Prog Coordinator Ms Latifa Augustino, Trainer	Kibada
		Ndagoni
		Baleni
		Chunguruma

In the project sites, data was collected using different methods including interviews with Project Officers, Project Coordinators, Ward Executives, Village Executives, and Village Committees Chairs. We held Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with Interfaith Committee members, and IR-VICOBA leaders. Participatory meetings with project target population including the IR-VICOBA group members, PETs Committee members, and paralegal teams. Throughout the exercises, evaluators ensured wide participation. Different voices, including women and youth we given chance to express themselves. In the IR-VICOBA meetings, all members were given equal chance to participate.

## Table of Key informants Interviewed

Category	No of Interviewees
Program Officers	8
District Coordinators	3
Facilitators and Animators	5
Interfaith Committee members	14
Women Interfaith Networks	8
PETs Committee members	32
Paralegals	21
IR-IR-VICOBA groups and Network Members	3
Local Village Government Officials	23
Total	

## LIMITATIONS OF THE EVALUATION

The findings of this evaluation are limited to the extent of the amount of information that the evaluation team was able to collect and reporting from the partners, committees, and beneficiaries. One of the major constraint was the time limitations in the sites and also the evaluation coincided with heavy rains in the coastal region. As a result, some villages that the evaluators wished to sample were not reached. There was one village in Mtwara (Nanguruwe) and in Lindi (Mahumbika) which the evaluators were not able to visit. In Lindi, evaluators also had challenges connecting with the IFC and the coordinator<sup>1</sup>.

## FINDINGS: PROJECTS SYNTHESIS

This section presents the evaluation results and findings in specific programme evaluation areas including project design, institutional capacity, relevance, project effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, accountability, project results and outcomes, and impact in the community. As a whole, the general performance of the programme is affirmative. The various activities under the programme and specific project have made marks in various levels ranging from establishment of inter-faith committee, uniting communities and ensuing action, and notable changes in the communities in terms of economic empowerment, participation in decision making especially in relation to oil and gas, demanding for accountability and public expenditure tracking. Also, there is progress in terms of access to justice spurred by the work of trained paralegals in the communities although their work is not optimal.

The **design** of the programme which involves working with and through partners and working with inter-faith groups was identified to have been effective to some extent but not all partners have had the capacity that matches the project needs. The establishment of inter-faith committees and faith leaders was found to have presented direct access to the target population, build trust and unity in communities and more importantly, helped to bridge gaps and fissures that existed in the communities. As a whole, the programme was credited for creating peace and understanding among people who, hitherto, viewed themselves as different.

The programme and projects are **relevant** based on the identified need. Through the accountable oil and gas programme, the projects have attempted to address a range of issues that directly affect the communities using different approaches. The level of **effectiveness** was found to vary across the different project influenced by, among others, characteristics of the target communities and the strength of implementing partners. The different projects partners' have distinct qualities, the performance across board is varied.

The efficiency levels are somehow satisfactory with challenges in the adherence to the timelines. Overall, the utilization of resources within the programme is notable with the projects using the funds allocated to implemented relevant activities. The work and outcomes on the ground relative to the financial resources are noteworthy. While it has been difficulty to directly link the work to oil and gas

---

<sup>1</sup> Evaluators made all efforts to get in touch with the IFC Coordinator without success. We left Mtwara and made it to Lindi early afternoon having agreed to meet the IFC. However, the Coordinator kept giving excuses and had to cancel. The next day we met the other groups hoping to meet IFC later in the afternoon. Again, we were not successful in reaching the coordinator.

because the industry has not picked up, communities are clearly aware of the possible long term implications and are slowly getting prepared.

The different partner organizations have the capacity to successfully implement the programme successfully using the structures in place. Their capacities and the level of commitment however was found to vary. BAKWATA in Lindi was found to have faced challenges in terms of capacity. In Mafia, ELCT-ECD was found to have been lacking in terms of the responsible officer's time committed to the project. Also in the two districts, the linkages between the project officers and field coordinators were not as smooth as expected.

The programme through the projects and other systems such as national Interfaith Council, has and continue to impact the oil and gas conversation and as well as the target populations. Notable in this project is the involvement of women and youth. Women are the dominant group in IR-VICOBA with men playing catch up. The PETs Committees and paralegals have a good participation of women and youth. There is an indication that the programmes outcomes will continue to accrue, but only if the current realities hold. The project present opportunities for sustainability with strengthened IR-VICOBA and ensuing culture of saving, communities and groups actively pursuing income generating project, growing culture of participation in governance and community unities.

These are comprehensively addressed in the sections below.

## **Programme Design**

This programme was designed to utilize a number of structures and a number of things stand out. First, the approach uses various faith based partners to implement the project in their areas of operation. Secondly is the establishment of the District Interfaith Committees (DICs) which was identify as the first line of entry into the community, using the influence of faith leaders. Third is the multi-pronged approach around PET work, the training and paralegal practice and economic empowerment activities through entrepreneurship training and IR-VICOBA's.

Respondents found the use of partners to have an upside. It allows implementation to run smoothly because the programme has been able to utilise, among others, experience in the implementation area as well as presence on the ground. Two partners, TEC in Mtwara and TCRS in Kilwa largely have capacity. ELCT-ECD in Mafia and BAKWATA in Lindi however, struggled (these will be addressed comprehensively under institutional capacity). TEC and TCRS have also worked in their areas for a long time and have a good understanding of the various stakeholders and already established contacts with the target population. This therefore allowed them to smoothly integrate in their area of operations.

The DICs are an important aspect of the programme design. The DICs that were constituted are inclusive bringing together the dominant Muslim and Christian faith. While Muslim faiths are largely organised under one umbrella, the Christians are more diverse, with various denominations of various sizes. All these were brought together under one roof. The implication of this involvement has been the ability to reach the target audience and use the influence of faith leaders whenever necessary. The DIFCs also helped to bridge a gap that existed in communities. There were conflict and mistrust

between people of different faiths. When they saw their leaders together and through dialogue, these were healed and community followed. According to the Chair of Mtwara IFC:

*The question of bringing different strengths together is important. There are different needs that communities have and they cannot be solved by an individual or a single group. Mobilizing different groups is important. People need peaceful coexistent, progress, education and so on. To address this, you need to bring everyone together.*

These collective approach captures the spirit of both accountability and natural resources. Demand for accountability can be best done through a collective. Natural resources are a shared means and thus cannot be attributed to a specific group. Thus the communal approach fits perfectly. Finally, the three sets of activities in the communities -- PETs, paralegals and IR-VICOBA-- have been important. These activities were preceded by training and awareness creation which was aimed at building capacity and put everyone on the same page. The PETs activities awakened the communities into thinking about the public resources that are generated locally and how they should be utilised. The paralegal activities have touched on the people's rights, the questions of access to justice and conflict resolution both from internal and external perspectives.

However, it is important to note that overall, the target population struggles to view the project from "Accountable resource governance of oil and gas sector" perspective. While the DIFCs members, coordinators, facilitators and some members understand the nexus between the programme and project activities on one hand and oil and gas on the other, majority of target population are not able to make the connection. Part of it has to do with the fact that there aren't many visible oil and gas activities that have kicked off so far. Also, the concept of accountability is not well understood.

## **Programme Relevance**

The *Accountable Resource Governance of Oil and Gas Sector* relevance was examined through different dimensions. One was the extent to which the objectives of the program are still valid and what possible changes would be necessary in the next phase. Second is the relevance of the projects in relation to what other organizations are focusing on, related to accountable governance of natural resources and the extent to which the program contribute to NCA's Country Strategic Framework for Tanzania.

The project was aligned to NCA-Tanzania's country strategy and Global endeavours of seeking economic justice. By targeting the Oil and Gas sector, the project addresses a critical subject which, if well managed has a significant potential of determining and changing Tanzania's future development path. The project was also relevant because the interventions presented the potential of unlocking the high levels of poverty and economic exclusion which the region has faced. The project identified outcomes (there are no clear objectives in the project documents) were exhaustive but the information gathered during the evaluation shows that they may benefit from re-adjustments to suit the changing political, economic and investment dynamics of the oil and Gas industry as it is unfolding in the area.

This evaluation also examined the extent to which ensuring accountability from the gas and oil sector players was relevant to the local population as well as the importance of economic empowerment relevant to the local population. Ensuring accountability from gas and oil players was relevant to local

population and remains important in the long run. As residents of an area that is endowed with resources and largely lagging behind in key economic indicators, it is imperative to ensure that local communities are at the forefront of reaping benefits accrued. This understanding is critical both in theory and practice. As such, having the understanding that players must be accountable is critical and a basis for the population action, that of practically, demanding the accountability. However, there are serious questions on the extent to which the project arrangement is able to get deeper into accountability. More so when majority of the population are engaged in everyday struggles. As alluded earlier, the target population struggle to get to the depth of accountability.

Activities geared towards the economic empowerment is critical to the local population in the four target districts. Local populations identify economic challenges as one of the hindrance to better lives while at the same time starting to become aware that they indeed have resources, including land and favourable climate and soil which are good for agricultural production, ranging from crop farming to animal rearing. The different entrepreneurship and income generating activities that have been promoted in the projects have opened local communities' eyes into diverse opportunities for economic production, and ultimately contribute to empowerment.

### **Partnerships and Engagement (FBOs/Religious Leaders, networks, platforms, village committees)**

This area examined the various aspects of partnership and engagement through the different structures established in the program.

#### ***Selection of partners***

The evaluation examined how the implementing partners were selected. The partners were considered based on their presence in the different target district, their experience working with communities, past experience working with NCA and organization capability which ultimately contribute to the ability to reach out to the target population and also built relevant networks necessarily in meeting the programme goals. The selection criteria was well thought and provided the best options available for NCA. The partners were selected based on prior experience working with NCA as partners, their physical presence and credibility in the project implementation areas. The partners understanding of the interfaith approach and ability to mobilise and work with religious leaders were major determinants.

#### ***Decision making within partnership***

Working in partnership, decision making processes are important in determining the success in implementation. The evaluation examined the extent to which partners involved in decision making regarding the planning and implementation of the program and the responses were positive. Partners reported that they have been involved in every step of decision making. At the project level, the partners reported having freedom to make decisions that are context specific. The decision making is participatory.

#### ***Success of the partnership model***

In examining the extent to which the 'partnership model' used in this project has been successful, we note that the level of success is largely dependent on the partners' strength. Partners that are well

established and have better working systems are able doing a better job in reaching the target population.

They were also found to have been able to better organize the different groups. For example, the IFCs under both TEC and TCRS are more vibrant and involved in different activities, some even beyond the confines of the project. TEC have even gone ahead to mobilise and organize an Interfaith Committee at Women level that work under the Women Interfaith Network (WIN). The coordination on the ground for the two partners is considerable better. For ELCT-ECD, the weak link appears to be at the coordination level between the Program Officer and the Coordinator which also affects the working of the Mafia IFC.

In Lindi the partnership model with BAKWATA had challenges. BAKWATA as partner had some internal organisational challenges and NCA had to manage the project directly from its office in Dar es Salaam. The district Interfaith Committee was also not strong enough and coordination between the program and the interfaith committee was quite difficult. At the time of conducting the evaluation, the Program officer for BAKWATA had resigned from her position. It was therefore not clear how future project coordination would be undertaken.

It is important to note the difference between the strength of a partnership model and the successes of the model. The partnership as a strategy is suited especially given the diverse areas of implementation. The successes of the partnership model is however largely dependent on the partners. Thus, the selection and following through the actual performance of the partners is also critical.

### ***Engaging Religions Leaders***

Engaging religious leaders was valuable for the project. It was an effective way of mobilizing the target population and more importantly, creating understanding that was necessary for a meaningful implementation to happen. In Msimbati village in Mtwara for example, because the natural resources had led to violent conflict, this had permeated into the community, creating dangerous division. There was also high level of mistrust especially on anything to do with gas. When religious leaders were engaged, they were able to cultivate understanding because they are trusted by their faithful.

As a collective, the IFCs have also proved effective in creating awareness, mobilizing communities, creating linkages and understanding with the government and engaging in various advocacy activities. Members of IFCs are also actively acting as links to the national conversation about oil and gas and essential part of training. Awareness activities that start with targeting the faith leaders are easily cascaded to other groups and communities.

At the national level the Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and integrity of Creation was becoming a major rallying point for religious advocacy for accountability and economic justice in the extractive sector. During the project implementation period, the ISEJC organised a number of high visits and meetings for religious leaders. The ISEJC has also become part of a larger Tanzania Civil Society network engaged in advocacy for economic justice, transparency and accountability in the extractive sector. Through these networks the ISCJEC has organised a series of public dialogues between government, civil society under the concept of 'Indaba' and through these platforms identified areas for reform and improving the entire extractive sector governance.

***Degree of partner coordination and involvement with other natural resource governance platforms, networks and organization's in Tanzania (national and local)***

While the IFCs are working at district and even regional level (Mtwara), the National Interfaith platform is yet to be formed. The absence of a national interfaith platform is viewed as a major gap in the implementation structure. Without a national interfaith platform, the District and Regional interfaith committees have remained hanging without proper anchorage at the National level. The Inter-Religious VICOBA platform(s) were yet to form. It was hoped that they would be launched in 2016 but NCA found it necessary to first design a clear strategic direction that would guide the activities. Initially, it was expected that there will be about 10 strong network. By December 2016, there were 27 networks by the end of 2016, which is way above the expected number. Thus it was found necessary to have guiding instruments including a Constitution and organising modalities that are manageable.

There are number of processes that have been fulfilled building from village levels, ward and at the District. There are also registration modalities that need to be filed with Ministry of Home Affairs. The District Networks that have already started are being strengthened including training the leaders that were elected to build their capacity.

Considering the above, the formation of a functioning national platform within the three year period was rather ambitious. Given the fact that the national platform derives its strength from the lower level (district and regional), it is sensible to ensure that there are strengthened first to ensure that there is strong basis. Once the foundation is properly laid, the basis for national platform is laid, the execution will be simple. As such, there is satisfactory evidence that work towards national platform is being done but obviously, the expected time lines were missed.

***What mechanisms did the project use and how effective have they been in engaging program stakeholders.***

Available literature and interviews suggests that NCA used at least four strategies or approaches to engage stakeholders and hereunder we reflect on their effectiveness as follows:

One, partner meetings and participatory approaches were used. Before the project started meetings were held with the partners to clarify on the project expectations. The partners were also involved in the baseline study and therefore in mapping out the potential areas for engagement. This laid ground for project implementation.

Two, NCA used IR-IR-VICOBA as a vehicle for community mobilisation. Through this approach groups of 20-30 members were mobilised in the project areas and trained on savings and borrowing. The groups have been effective in attracting people to the project and also serve as a focal point for remaining and working together.

Three, religious leaders and faith structures were used as fulcrums for community engagement, advocacy, mobilisation peace and oversight of the project. Using their strong diaconal strengths and respect in the communities, the religious leaders explained the relevance of the project, encouraged communities to engage, campaigned for peace in the project areas and therefore setting optimal conditions for project implementation.

Four, public dialogues and exposure visits were also used. Through the ISEJC a number of high-level meetings were held, CSO were mobilised and campaign for better Mining policies and practices

(*Indaba*) were organised in collaboration with a local network of NGOs working for Justice in the Extractive Sector –Haki Rasilimali platform. This platform also provided opportunities for religious leaders to interact with other members of the civil society and government

Finally, various training were conducted and used as conduits for passing on new knowledge and skills to the stakeholders and local communities. To an extent these trainings were effective in imparting some new knowledge although there was need for more knowledge about Oil and Gas economy.

### *Achievements by religious leaders*

Under the IFCs, the religious leaders have made some achievements. The first one is uniting the communities and helping to fight the various perceived differences. Secondly, they have helped to recast the community needs as collective and shared making it possible to mobilize for action. Third, faith leaders have been useful in awareness creation in the communities. They have helped the community to understand the importance of various activities, ranging for accountability practices, the importance of economic empowerment, and people’s right. Religious leaders have worked as a critical bridge between the people and the government, including in areas where conflict existed. They have also acted as the ‘guarantors’ of project activities in the district especially among administrators. Projects that are fronted by faith leaders are seen as ‘clean’ and can be trusted.

Because of their involvement and working together, the profile of religious leaders have risen in their community. Speaking with the same voice has led to being listened across the board. Religious leaders have assumed a central role in demanding for accountability and transparency within the communities, which have also empowered PETs groups in their work. Even within the project itself, the religious leaders are asking critical questions regarding the running of the project. Religious leaders feels that involvement in this project has made the different stakeholders aware of their place. In all districts, they reported that they are now been invited in different engagements. They are being recognized more than before.

### **Programme Effectiveness**

The programme effectiveness was examined in relation to achievement of the objectives, the level of clarity of the strategy clear and the extent to which NCA and partners followed it, the assumptions and risks and their impact on the strategy; and how they have been managed. The budget was also reviewed to establish how financial resources were shared and spread and utilised to deliver the reported results. Due time constraints, a detailed value for money evaluation was not undertaken. The evaluators have recommended that NCA may consider undertaking such an evaluation in the future.

### *Achievement of objectives*

The project document does not mention any specific objectives but it provides **seven expected results/outputs** that the NCA planned to deliver through the various project interventions<sup>2</sup>. In our evaluation the absence of a well formulated menu of specific objectives for this project was a major oversight whose effects are discussed in other sections of this report. For evaluation purposes and after consultations with NCA, we have considered or treated the expected results or outputs as the project objectives and under this section we briefly evaluate their level of success

---

<sup>2</sup> 2014-2016 Tanzania Oil for Development Proposal, pgs 5-6

<b>Summary of Output, Baseline, Target and Achievements</b>	
<b>Output 1</b>	<b>Religious leaders and FBOs have been empowered and actively engage in gas policy processes at both local and national levels</b>
Baseline Figure	Religious leaders lack a platform/meeting place where they can come together to discuss and formulate joint messages to the communities
Target	At least 2 Research reports on Gas Sector/gas value chain have been published and distributed to religious leaders by the end of 2016 At least 4 multi stakeholder consultations are conducted (FBOs, CSOs, govt officials and private sector) in targeted districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	The ISEJIC conducted a study on local service levy from paid by the Oil and Gas companies. A report from the study was produced and distributed. The report has been used as a resource for knowledge formation and advocacy for better mining policies and practices. Another study in follow up of the findings from the One Billion dollar question report produced in 2012 was underway. However synthesis of this information into simple language and distribution of the synthesised information back into the communities would improve access to information further
<b>Output 2</b>	<b>Community members are engaged in tracking village incomes and expenditures through PETS</b>
Baseline Figure	Communities complain of lack of transparency & accountability from local leaders Low participation in village meetings and leaders have given up on calling meetings
Target	At least 40 PETS Committees (10 people per committee-40% women) formed in the 4 targeted districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	The project succeeded in establishing 15 PETS (68F and 86M) Committees with around 124 members in the four districts. These committees, albeit still operating at low level and with a number of challenges, the committees are beginning to act as centres for monitoring local accountability. It is likely that with future support and encouragement they could transform into agencies for accountability and change
<b>Output 3</b>	<b>Local governments are making public village incomes and expenditures through public notice boards</b>
Baseline Figure	Community members complain of lack of information and reports of incomes and expenditure from the leaders Local village leaders lack training on leadership, Governance and Democracy Not well informed about the issue of Gas/Oil exploration by district councils.
Target	At least 40 Villages are provided with public notice boards in the four targeted districts by end of 2016. At least 40 villages displaying budgets , income and expenditure reports in the 4 targeted districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	No public notice boards had been provided in all the four 4 districts and villages.
<b>Output 3</b>	<b>Religious leaders use their religious platforms to demand transparency on gas economy</b>
Baseline Figure	Religious leaders have influence and committed to using their platforms to promote peaceful co-existence
Target	At least 2 statements issued by religious leaders At least 20 press conferences conducted by ISCEJ At least 20 religious leaders (30 % women) in 4 districts have sensitised communities through the pulpit by 2016
Achievement.	Religious leaders have been mobilised at each district. A network of women faith leaders was established in Mtwara. The religious leaders have been vital in building inroads into society

	explaining the relevancy of the project and encouraging peaceful relations. The religious leaders have also created a bridge for dialogue and interaction between government, Oil companies and citizens on gas issues, peace and economic development.
<b>Output 4</b>	<b><i>Community Members have knowledge of economic, social rights and land issues and property inheritance</i></b>
Baseline Figure	High Gender inequality with women carrying biggest family workload High prevalence of GBV against women. Religious beliefs, patriarchal system and ownership of resources as a major cause Early child marriages, divorce and over dependency by child mothers
Target	At least 4 paralegals (5women and 5 men) formed in each targeted district At least 600 people have accessed free legal aid from paralegals in targeted districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	The project has succeeded in training 68 paralegals and 3 established paralegal centres have been established in the four districts. These paralegals are a new innovative approach toward addressing human rights and injustice at the community levels. Paralegals provide free legal aid and resolving domestic conflicts in villages where they already functional. The paralegals are however yet to engage in cases related to Oil and gas and their capacities in this area would be of significant help.
<b>Output 5</b>	<b><i>IR-VICOBA groups have been formed and empowered on gas value chain</i></b>
Baseline Figure	Reported high poverty levels with 80-90% living below poverty Majority annual earnings range between Tsh100,000-Tsh 500,000 Microfinance and Self-help groups like VICOBA and 'Upatu' have been established by other NGOs and women respectively
Target	At least 200 IR-VICOBA groups (70% women) formed and trained on gas value chain in the 4 districts by end of 2016 At least 80 TOTs trained (50% women and men) on GAS Value Chain in 4 targeted districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	The project succeeded in mobilising 36 IR-VICOBA groups in the four districts with a total number of 825 members with a cumulative saving of slightly above Tsh 220 Million from which the members are now borrowing to engage in some business. In Mafia alone Tsh 141.7Million has been borrowed
<b>Output 6</b>	<b><i>IR VICOBA start their own business and tap business opportunities available</i></b>
Baseline Figure	Communities expect presence of the oil and Gas industry will provide market for locally produced goods, improved social services including health, water and sanitation Women earn incomes from small business like selling fried fish, buns and vegetables. Annual incomes are below Tsh100,000
Target	At least 100 IR VICOBA members (80% women) in the 4 districts are engaged in value addition activities by end of 2016 At least 200 IR VICOBA members (80% women) have started small and medium businesses in the 4 districts by end of 2016
Achievement.	Only 36 IR-VICOBA groups have been formed.. In Mafia the groups are making Batik Fabrics for and others have started a butcher business, slaughtering cows and selling meat to the local residents. They also produce local soap detergent for sale. In Mtwara some women have started poultry project and selling tomatoes to employees of Dangote Cement company

## **Evaluation of expected project results/Objectives**

### ***Religious leaders and FBOs have been empowered and actively engage in gas policy processes at both local and national levels***

Religious leaders have been mobilised at the local and national levels. Three district and one regional interfaith committee has been established. The Interfaith standing committee has built the capacity of religious leaders at local and national level on issues about gas economy. The ISEJC led religious leaders see the mobilisation and interfaith approach used to mobilise them as a window to working together for a common good. The success of this was summed by the Chair of the interfaith community in Mtwara who said;

*The person who came up with the interfaith approach was right. Religions usually have the same goal. But when you put them together, they are able to build unity in diversity. “Wananjenga umoja wa pamoja”. In many situations, religions have a tendency of dividing people. Here people are able to come together for common good.*

They were sensitised on the new Oil and Gas law, the local content law. However the capacity building interventions are said to be ad hoc. The ISEJC faced financial constraints and was therefore not able to mount sustained campaigns and initiatives for religious leaders. As a consequence the targets were not yet fully met.

### ***Community members are engaged in tracking village incomes and expenditures through PETS***

The project succeeded in mobilising **15 PETS** Committees in the four districts. This was below the targeted **40 PETS** Committees that were planned to be established by end of 2016. Factors that affected the pace of PETS committees being formed included delays due to the general election and the general resistance that PETS committees face in undertaking *their work*.

### ***Local governments are making public village incomes and expenditures through public notice boards***

The project targeted to supply 40 villages with public notice boards. The evaluation team did not see any public notice board distributed by the project. The number of villages (40 Villages) targeted to benefit from the public notice boards was higher than the total number of villages (16) selected for project implementation. There was no indication of how the extra 24 villages would have benefited from the project. The project targeted to have 40 villages displaying publicly village incomes and expenditures via public notice boards. Only 4 (Majengo, Kiwawa, Ndagoni and Baleni) of the villages visited displayed public information. The information was pasted on the walls of their offices. The information displayed was largely about national voter identity cards and names of village government representatives. Vital information relating to incomes and expenditures was still missing. This suggested that the project was yet to achieve on this target.

### ***Religious leaders use their religious platforms to demand transparency on gas economy***

Religious leaders are represented in the Multi Stakeholders Group of the Tanzania Extractive Industries Initiative (TEITI) and have used the various forums organised by the ISEJC to demand for more transparency in the extractive industry, Together with other civil society actors, religious leaders

contributed to the advocacy leading to the enacting of the Tanzania Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative Act (TEITA) in 2016. The extent to which religious leaders have used their pulpits to demand for accountability in the gas sector was difficult to measure.

***Community Members have knowledge of economic, social rights and land issues and property inheritance***

The project has established 3 paralegal groups and trained 68 paralegal workers in the four districts. In some villages, the paralegals are active and have been providing basic legal advice to clients. They have resolved in some cases and mediated in others. Gender Based Violence and land cases are the majority of cases handled. There are no documented cases related to the oil and gas sector. The total number of cases handled is slightly under 200 suggesting that the total number of clients served was still below target. The factors explaining the low uptake included low community recognition of paralegals, lack of resources, facilitation and capacity among the paralegals.

***IR-VICOBA groups have been formed and empowered on gas value chain***

Only 36 (equivalent to 18%) IR-VICOBA groups have been formed out of the targeted 200 IR-VICOBA groups. The groups received training on saving and loans and running the IR-VICOBA model. They acknowledge that IR-VICOBA is better than other VICOBA models implemented by other organisations in the area. So far they have mobilised around Tsh220 Million in savings and appear to be growing in numbers, membership and savings constantly. However the groups lack close follow up trainings and were not adequately trained on the operations of the oil and gas economy.

***IR VICOBA start their own business and tap business opportunities available***

Some IR-VICOBA group members have started small businesses making dyed fabrics, making detergents and selling domestic consumer goods like soap, sugar and cooking oil. The capacity of the group members to sell to the oil and gas companies was still low. Opportunities for selling to oil and Gas companies in some districts like Mafia were unrealistic since there were no active on going petroleum activities in the area. The general evaluation of the project achievements against its expected results and targets shows that the project if measured quantitatively scored below target.

**Project Impact**

The project sought to ensure that government of Tanzania at local and national level improves transparency, accountability, curbs corruption. It further sought to ensure citizens from the targeted areas are protected and benefit from the gas extraction to avoid previous bad experience in the mining sector. In the long-term it was expected that Accountable governance of oil and Gas sector will contribute to poverty reduction and enhance sustainable livelihood in Tanzania<sup>3</sup>.

Our evaluation is that the overall level of project impact was still low. All key informants interviewed during the field visits were of the view that the overall impact and success rate of the project was between 45-50%. Others even suggested lower rankings. But nonetheless, they were of the view that the achievements were commendable given the circumstances during implementation. As one Program Officer explained:

---

<sup>3</sup> ibid

*By the fact we managed to achieve what we have recorded so far is something commendable. This project was quite different from the others. A number of mistakes were made along the way. The level of ambition was too high, the selection of project implementation areas was too wide and yet the resources and time frame was too limited. Our understanding of Gas operations and Gas economy was too scanty. Some of us and our partners came to fully understand the dynamics and challenges related Gas operations during our meetings with the companies (Statoil) after the project had started.*

In our view, it was too early to assess the impact given that the project had been fully operational for effectively two years. It is possible that the impacts of this project may be seen in the future but at the time of conducting the evaluation the impact was quite remote. There were no significant major changes in the baseline conditions that were reported during the baseline survey.

### ***Clarity of the strategy***

The strategy of the programme was fairly clear among all partners. All key players in the projects including IFCs, coordinators and facilitators went through a consistent process starting with awareness creation to understand the whole idea of the project. These players reported that they clearly understood the project, with exception of Mafia where there is a new coordinator who was not properly briefed. In the four districts, the implementation is very consistent and the entire activities mirror each other, save for the context specific dynamics. In three of four districts, the IFCs were clearly briefed on their role and have been fulfilling it. In Mafia however, the IFC while clearly briefed on their role in the beginning of the project, the implementation did not follow through and therefore not full involved. It was however evident that NCA understood the strategy more clearly than its partners. NCA was able to locate where the project fitted in its Country strategy. It was not easy for the partners to explain how the project contributed to their overall organisation strategy. One partner did not have an Organisation strategy and there were signs that NCA was the key driver of the project.

### ***Assumptions and risks and their impact on the strategy; and how they have been managed***

There are a number of assumptions that were inbuilt in the programme. One, there was the assumption that *a vibrant economy will emerge from the oil and gas activities*. This would then, indirectly, have a number of implication to the community. There would for example be some level of inward movement of new population which will create certain demands. Other assumption include that such activity would then see more public resource generated. However, this didn't really happen. Also, apart from committee members and group leaders, the population see a more direct benefit. This has not happened. However, because the question of income generation is central to people's lives and everyone would generally want to improve their standards, there is genuine effort to engage more and take advantage of different realities. For example, with good prices of cashewnuts in Mtwara, people are using the groups (as source of financial support) to improve their farming. The groups are also being used as basis to improve lives from a collective perspective. Thus, the basic idea of bringing people together has its own benefits that can be seen by target population.

Secondly, in organising VICOBA, the underlying assumption is that people will use this as a source of funding for well-thought and beneficial activities. The loans are therefore an important tool for capital.

However, there are instances where members of the groups are taking loans, because they have to, and don't know what to do with them. The idea is for the population to engage in activities that will promote money circulation. Within the group, there are self-correcting measures. When members see their peers struggling to repay, they think twice before approving the loan. When they see their successful peers who are engaging with productive activities, they also learn. Also, many groups are engaging in collective activities such as business and farming activities meaning the funds are being utilised together.

On the training, the assumption was the skills would be gained and groups receive some materials. Then they will be linked with suppliers. This however has been difficult because the beneficiaries tend to go back to the partners wanting help to get to the supplier and also saying that they do not have enough money to undertake sustained activities. Similarly, there are widespread thinking across groups, and also in PETs and Paralegal activities that they need more push from supporting partners in terms of seed money, establishing offices or support in arranging meetings. Related to the above is the high level of reliance of field coordinators who are expected to be in different areas. However, their movement is limited while the demand for their attention is extremely high in the varied activities.

One of the risk in this programme was the conflicts arising in some districts, such as Mtwara that have been occasioned by gas. Fortunately, these were resolved and the presence of faith leaders helped to calm the situation. The other risk has been that, because the regions covered by the programme are predominantly Muslim, the areas implemented by Christian based organisations (all except Lindi) are likely to face challenge in building trust and acceptance. Indeed, there were questions raised in some villages such as Rushungi in Kilwa and Chunguruma in in Mafia. The interpretation was that the implementers, being religious organisation may be interested in converting the target population as opposed to implementing development based projects. The presence of IFCs which we inclusive was helpful. The religious leaders were able to explain the programme and diffuse the worries.

In VICOBA, there was the risk of practices in managing finances going against the target population's Islamic practices. In Lindi, the question of interest charged on IR-VICOBA loans emerged, which was viewed contrary to the Islamic banking principles. However, this was explained by Sheikh and accepted.

### **Managing the risk that the envisaged Oil and Gas operations may never happen in some selected villages**

The project was based on over expectation that the volume of Oil and Gas operations would be high in the project implementation areas. Since, the gas operations in the area have remained significantly low and local gas political and economic dynamics changed. Some operations were suspended and others moved from one village to another. For example the plan to set up an LNG plant was moved from Rushungi village in Kilwa to another village in Lindi. This significantly changed the local dynamics and thwarted the citizen's expectations to benefit from the gas operations in the area.

### **Project Efficiency**

Under this criterion, the projects' efficiency level is examined in terms of the partners' performances based on the funding model, the timeliness in the delivering the outputs, adequacy of resources and

cost effectiveness. It also examines employment of project efficiencies, and extent has the management of the NCA and management of the partner organization project (with several partners and semi-operational administration) influenced efficiency.

The four projects under the programme have performed fairly in relation to the funding model. By targeting multiple partners in different contexts, that share some characteristics yet diverse, has helped in reaching wide target groups. The partners have been able to reach vast population in an inclusive manner, especially through wide involvement of women as well as good number of youth. The level of penetration is considerably high. The model has ensured that resources get to the target population without complicated bureaucratic processes.

On timeliness in delivering outputs, the programme activities were not strictly done within the programme window. However, there has been delays in the disbursement of funds from the beginning that meant some activities have been delayed. These have happened in the consequent disbursement period. Consequently, coordinators have found it difficult to mount activities in the time expected. That said, large part of these delays have also been occasioned by partner's inability to submit reports in time which means some periods that are unaccounted and therefore funds could not be released before this is done. .

***To what extent have the resources been utilized based on the project targets?***

The programme has an element of cost-effectiveness due to the localization of activities. The target populations are easily reached and most interactions are done within the existing resources. With the exceptions of a few trainings that have been done in hired space, groups in villages meet in public spaces such as village halls. Others are even able to improvise and meet under the tree.

The trainings were organized in such a way that those that are able to get the skills can pass them to the larger groups. Also, the programme has worked with volunteer facilitators. All these contribute to efficiencies. This is clearly illustrated by the budgetary figures that shows that the amount of resources that ended up on the ground and that may have been directly touched the target population is, at the highest estimate, about 40% (as explained below).

The management of the NCA has influenced efficiencies. One, through internal controls and clear guidelines, the partners are able to work within the established structures. Also, the management of the partner organizations have various levels which ensures proper control. On the ground, the Coordinator ensures that the day to day activities are running smoothly. Beyond this, at partner's level, there are programme officers who are in charge of the projects and work with coordinator in the implementation. However there was a feeling among field coordinators that a big chunk of the budget remained at their organisation head offices in Dar es Salaam. A deeper discussion is needed between NCA and its partners on how more resources can be channelled to the local level.

## Budget Analysis

### *Budget Distribution by partner*

Partner	Budget Allocation	Percentage share
NCA	555,228	21.4%
CCT	555,459	21.4%
TEC,BAKWATA, ELCT & TCRS	1,267,100	49%
NCA-Admin Charge	205,545	8.2%
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,583,332</b>	<b>100%</b>

The budget shows that resources were thinly spread on the ground. The four partners (TEC, BAKWATA, ELCT and TCRS) operating on the ground in the four districts (Mtwara, Lindi, Kilwa and Mafia) shared 49% of the total budget. This suggests that on average 10% of the budget was actually spent in each of the districts. In 2015 and 2016 for example TCRS received Tsh 24mln and Tsh34 Mln respectively on activities in the entire Kilwa district. Part of this funds also catered for the administration costs of the partners hence significantly reducing the actual amount spent on project implementation in the districts.

### *Budget Share by Activity*

No	Activity	Amount	Percentage
1	Baseline Survey	94,340	4%
2	Research	282,859	11%
3	Establish of Interfaith	243,500	9%
4	Capacity Building & Awareness	270,600	10%
5	Formation of IR-VICOBA	354,700	13%
6	Training on Accountable Governance	389,200	15%
7	Paralegals	280,200	11%
8	Learning and Networking	170,288	7%
9	Follow up and Monitoring	290,600	11%
	Total Activities	2,376,287	<b>92%</b>
	Total Budget	<b>2,583,332</b>	<b>100%</b>
10	Difference (NCA Admin Cost)	207,045	8%
	<b>Total Budget</b>	<b>2,583,332</b>	<b>100%</b>

The budget share by activity was well structured with training on Accountability and Economic empowerment (IR-VICOBA) taking the biggest share of 15% and 13% respectively of the total budget. It is however difficult to establish whether the budget allocated was efficient in generating the documented results largely because of lack of comparable data on what would be the best practice standard cost for undertaking activities of such a nature. In future, we recommend a value for money baseline analysis/evaluation to be conducted to benchmark average costs for such trainings.

It is also important to note that a considerable portion of the budget was spent on baseline survey, research, learning and networking and follow up monitoring. This accounts to 33% of the total budget. The outcomes of these activities are at best, long term. If there are plans to continue with the project, then this chunk will have been efficiently utilised. Without follow up similar activities after this cycle, then the figure will have been too high at this stage.

## **Project Accountability**

Project accountability constitutes an obligation for those who are responsible for management to be answerable for implementation processes in a transparent manner. It is also about taking responsibility over the resources entrusted on them. The model used by the NCA in this programme has inherent accountability mechanisms. This builds multi-level mechanisms of accountability. In theory, the four projects are accountable to the target population (mostly through representatives), faith organisations through their leaders, the government through representatives on the ground, and the donor.

In practice, the accountability mechanisms vary in the respective districts. In Mafia and Kilwa, there was functional accountability mechanisms to faith leaders, government officers and communities. This was supported by the fact that the project was also working closely with the government officers. In Mafia, the accountability mechanisms with faith leaders had gaps, but the project has been working closely with the local administration. There were also some gaps within the target population groups due to communication breakdowns among IR-VICOBA leaders. In Lindi, accountability with the target population was strong. There were gaps with the local administration who feel somehow disconnected. At the donor level, the four partners are accountable through the reporting mechanism, although there is need to strengthen these to ensure that gaps that emanate from partners are addressed at the earliest possible opportunity.

## **Results of the Project**

The following results were noted in the programme.

### ***Increased participation in public resources management.***

There is increased awareness and participation when it comes to public resources management. Target populations, through PETs are following up on the resources generated, demanding for accountability and transparency. In Lindi, Ng'apa, a facilitator explained how a local administrator who had used public income for personal gain has been brought to task.

*Last week we met in the village meeting. We followed up on the Ward Executive and found that they have spent some tax money collected through different projects such as the market. We spoke to the higher office and the Executive has been asked to explain. We know that trucks that collect coconuts are charged and every lorry is charged Tshs. 15,000. All the money must be accounted for.*

These type of actions are important and shows participation in public resources management.

### ***Oil and gas policy***

The project contribution to the improvement and application of the Oil and Gas policy processes at the local and national level varies with different district. In Mtwara, the IFCs leadership has participated extensively in both national, regional and local policy processes. In Kilwa and Mafia, there hasn't been much participation. In Kiwawa and Villages in Kilwa and Ngapa villages in Lindi, questions still remains on the direct benefits to the communities from oil and gas discoveries in the area. Most communities only happen to fall on the pipeline route and some of the immediate outcome is getting seasonal jobs to clear and maintain the paths.

### ***Economic justice from oil and gas operations***

Examining the extent to which the project contributed towards economic justice and benefit from oil and gas operations in the project area, the project has succeeded in mobilizing religious leaders and communities in the areas to engage in economic empowerment and local accountability. Trainers and facilitators have been trained and are actively used for community mobilization and empowerment. The project has been a source of self-empowerment, community recognition and economic advancement. However, as mentioned elsewhere, beneficiaries and other stakeholders are still far removed from gas activities to fully pursue economic justice.

There programme did achieve results across the four districts. However, the results do not necessarily tally with the primary conceptualisation of the project. The role that the projects have played in their respective communities is visible especially among the target groups. This is true within IR-VICOBA, the work of PETs and paralegals. There are positive outcomes in terms of bringing communities together for collective actions by working with faith leaders. The results around training for economic empowerment have some gaps as discussed below:

#### ***Mobilization.***

One major outcome is that the target communities have mobilised themselves for various action within their settings. In all the four districts, people are mobilised, either through IR-VICOBAs, through PETs or through paralegal. This mobilisation is helping the community to respond to various needs, whether it is economic empowerment, pursuing their rights or management of public resources.

#### ***Knowledge, Skills and Capacity***

Through the various capacity building initiatives, the target population have gained useful skills that have the potential to propel them forward. In entrepreneurship, the trainings have brought new skills to group members. These range from making shoes, soap making, bee keeping, among others. Community members trained in PETs are now able to follow up on what is happening in their localities. The paralegals have also gained skills which they are using to respond to respond to local disputes that range from land, inheritance, to marital issues.

However, inadequate training of key project personnel like PETs Committees, Paralegal Members and Interfaith Committee members were noted. The available resources were not enough to conduct adequate training. Some Committees were trained only once and the trainings were general in nature. The trainings also lacked a level of specificity with detailed topics or modules on tracking Oil and Gas revenues or projects. This denied key project personnel vital skills to achieve the TOC and philosophy of the project.

Major topics covered during the trainings

<b>IR-IR-VICOBA</b>	<b>PETS</b>	<b>Paralegals</b>
How to form IR-IR-VICOBA groups, Saving and Borrowing, Value Addition training on making Tye and dye fabrics, shoe making and making of detergents like soap.	Introduction to PETS, How to establish PETs Committees, Importance of conducting PETs, Introduction to the Budget Cycle and report writing	Human Rights and Gender Based Violence, Law of Marriage and Sexual Offences, Inheritance , Children rights, Introduction to Land laws

## **Understanding of NCA's Theory of Change**

The TOC and underlying philosophy of this project was that if the capacity of the local citizens was built through a series of accountability and economic strengthening interventions, the citizens would thereafter act in response to the public resources, opportunities and economic justice challenges caused by the gas discoveries in the project area.

However, the TOC was not well elaborated and articulated to the parties and grass root implementers. As a challenge there was no specific training on the TOC which the program sought to achieve. The volume of gas operations in the project area was low and consequently, translating the TOC into tangible activities and aligning the program to the TOC was challenging and demonstrably absent. The partners implemented the project largely based on their local understanding of NCA's former accountability work. Reference to oil and gas in project implementation was quite remote. According to one of the partner program officers:

*When I reflect deeply, it is possible to suggest that pegging this project on Oil and Gas operations in the areas and tagging it as Oil for Development was over ambitious. We would have just called this project and Economic Empowerment and Accountability strengthening program and possibly called it Oil for Development project at a later stage.*

Thus, the accountability dimension from oil and gas perspective did not emerge as strongly as it ought to have been

### ***Unintended effects of the project***

There are a number of unintended outcomes of the projects. One, by working through IFCs, the faith based organisations in general have been challenged in relation to their involvement in development work, beyond spiritual realm. While the organised religious group have always had a developmental arms, the smaller faiths (especially) among the Christians have not really participated. Thus, opportunities to sit in the committees have allowed faith leaders to get involved and in a way, challenged them to think about community's welfare.

There is reported growing unity and understanding among the Muslim and Christian faithful which brings cohesiveness in the community. Communities repeatedly reported that the project has helped them to understand that they have shared interests. The suspicion that has existed before has been thawed as people are focused on issues that are productive. This has also reduced conflicted. Beyond the different religions, even Christians had not worked in unity before. But because the interfaith platforms have brought people together on one table, they have grown close and embraced each other.

Faith leaders reported that they are now being sought out for various activities, beyond the project. The government and its representatives are involving faith leaders more in various activities that are happening in the four target districts.

### ***Change in target groups***

There are a changes observed and reported in the target groups in different areas. These are overall skewed against accountability work which is anchor goal of the project. Local government officials interviewed reported that they are more responsive and willing to involve the community especially in the management of local resources. Some have also become more interested in economic

empowerment activities that are happening in the neighbourhood. In Kilwa for example, a deputy Ward Executive who is also an Extension Officer has started to organise trainings through the IR-VICOBA groups to train farmers of animal rearing and better farming methods.

More is notable in terms of communities engaging more actively in income generation. From IR-VICOBA perspective, the peer pressure to save was reported to spur people to get active so that they can find money to contribute. Because of the activities above, more people are engaging in income generating activities. They are using different skills and opportunities and turning them into ways to generate income. For example, those that have mats (mikeka) weaving skills are commercializing it. People are working to improve their farming more.

Women reported that they are improving their position and even feel more confident in different ways. For example, through IR-VICOBA where they are able to buy products in bulk, they ensure their homes are catered for. Some, like in Mtwara, buy *kangas* and feel well dressed. As one woman in Mtwara, “When you look good, you are confident. Look at us, our faces are shining. Few years ago we’d be dressed in rags.”

#### ***Quality of training and extent to which capacity of citizens was built to engage in accountability***

Training was provided and basic tools like note books were provided to the committees to document their work. The committees however found the durations of training as short and inadequate to cover the range of issues. The committees were trained for three days and as a consequence they still felt incapacitated to engage in complex discussions with local government officials on public expenditure matters. Like in other districts the trainings were generic in nature and lacked special focus on Oil and Gas which was essentially at the heart of the project.

In Mafia, there were prospects for petroleum discoveries in Ndagoni village. Exploratory wells had been drilled since early 2000’s but for some time, further operations had stalled. The local village government, the PETs committee members and citizens were not aware of what was going on. Thus despite the training, there is still some holding back on important matters that can be effectively followed up.

#### ***Extent of influence of PETs Committees and paralegals on local accountability***

The PETS committees and paralegals are working hard but are still struggling to exert their influence. Despite this, there is potential for this level of influence increasing overtime. Community understanding of PETS work still low, although in villages like Baleni and Kibada the level of appreciation was increasing. In 2016 the committee worked with the local citizens to track education and health projects. The local village government had started recognizing their role. In Ndagoni and Baleni, the village government had provided office space for the committee and paralegals to use for their work. It was evident that the number of cases reported to the committee would increase in the future as the capacity and exposure of the committees increased. The committees were young and motivated. They asked for more support. Close follow up and exposure visits of the committee members would be an incentive for better performance.

### ***Number of people have benefitted from project activities***

Available data suggests that the project has reached directly slightly above 1,331 people in the four districts. These were reached directly through the trainings, the IR-VICOBA groups, the Paralegals and PETs committees that were established and the public meetings organized by the ISEJIC. The number could be slightly higher if the number of clients who have benefited from the paralegal work is factored in. Around 84% of the members in the IR-VICOBA groups were women, representing a significant potential economic transformation for women and households

### **Project Outcomes**

This section looks at the outcomes of the programmes and projects on the target population. Given the short period of implementation, it is a little too early to talk about impact. Overall, the project has recorded some outcomes that can be highlighted.

1. There is increased citizen knowledge and involvement in the management of public resources and therefore emerging systems of accountability and transparency in the management of the same. In the implementation districts, through the PETS committee, citizens have put together processes that allow them to be watchdogs. The leaders have also understood that citizens are the rights holders and therefore, are careful to avoid corruption and misuse of public resources.
2. The project has laid a foundation upon which future accountability processes and interventions can be built. The project anticipated to increase access to information and citizen's participation in village meetings. So far little has been achieved but local government officials admit that there is a potential for improvement, especially as the citizens become aware of the project and volume of Oil and Gas operations increases in some of the project villages
3. Participation of religious leaders in national Oil and Gas policy and advocacy processes has slightly increased. Through the Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and Integrity of Creation religious leaders have participated in local and national Oil and Gas policy dialogues. In the past two years the ISCEJ has become a major player in national and international CSO networks bringing the voice of religious leaders into policy and advocacy discussions. Religious leaders are now valued and consulted by government in some of the Oil and Gas related issues.
4. People have improved access to justice and rights through the work of paralegals. This increase to access is accessible because it is in the locality and cost-effective because it saves times and resources. The paralegals are providing more amicable dispute resolutions which is allowing people to defend, among others, their land.
5. The economic position of women and young people reached has slightly improved. There are more women who are organised through IR-VICOBA's and related economic activities, and sizeable who are participating in PETS and paralegal activities. Young people are especially engaged in paralegal work.

6. The communities are united and there is peaceful co-existence. According to one member of the Mtwara Women Interfaith Group, “We are more united regardless of our background. We have bridged the religious boundaries. If something happen, we are coming together. We are seeing more love amongst us.”
7. The target population across the programme implementation area are now mobilised, active, engaged and committed in self-improvement. The population consistently spoke about ‘waking up’ because they have been left behind compared to their colleagues from other part of the country. Also notable is growing level of efficacy in terms of understanding that people have the ability to determine their social economic direction through active engagement in economic production.
8. The target population are developing a culture of saving and as a result, they have now mobilised some significant portfolio through the IR-VICOBA groups. These savings then forms a basis for loans that members can take, pure savings, and capital. The loans are advanced to members under various terms and conditions as agreed within the group. The savings on the other hand provide a solid basis for the groups and members. The groups are also using the mobilised funds as capital for various collective income generating activities.
9. The target population have reliable place to go for financial insulation, especially through the loans that are obtainable via IR-VICOBA. This has allowed them to meet varied range of needs that would not have been possible in the past. They include meeting educational and health needs, improving their agriculture through buying of inputs and business capital.
10. There are increased skills and knowledge that have, to a certain extent, helped target population to potentially diversify their production and economic activities. The target population now are knowledgeable in activities such as bee keeping, making of batik, soap making, and sandals making. They are yet to translate this knowledge into meaningful profitable businesses.

## **Project Sustainability**

The four project areas across the programmes have a promising level of sustainability through a number of systems and activities in place. However, the ability to maintain the activities at the same is mixed. The paralegals activities are gaining prominence in the community and are capable of continuing through community efforts. Because it is a new phenomenon, there is high possibility that more people will bring their cases as they gain trust in the paralegals. In Mtwara and Mafia, the future work can be maintained if the current level of activity remains. However, some are challenges, especially due to lack spaces. Some are using rented places using meagre resources. Without more resources, keeping up with the needs and demand may pose a risk.

The PET activities are entrenched in the village management committees. This model is sustainable especially because it largely ride on the knowledge and citizens understanding of their rights. In the four project areas, there is clear awakening because of the project on the need for participation in management of public resources. Engagements starting at village level also offers possibilities because they touch the lowest level of public expenditure and provide opportunities for escalating such issues.

The use of faith leaders as an entry to the community provides for sustainability mechanisms. Because faith organisations are well structured, they provide a fertile ground for building ideas. The structures in place creates possibilities for cross pollination of the project ideas and also succession between different players. Along the same lines, it is inspiring to see different structures emerge under the IFCs where key population groups are actively engaged including women and youth. These again, provide for long term possibilities. In addition to faith networks, the close working relationships between different stakeholders offer strength moving forward. Working with public building from village committees to the district level is a huge plus.

The activities around economic empowerment have gained good traction in the target communities. Members are well organised in groups and the need to make constant contributions have motivated them to work hard and look for constant sources of income. In most districts, the IR-VICOBA are not being broken, hence providing solid platform for investment and saving. Secondly, members are engaging more in income generating activities, both as individuals and as groups. At the group level, they are either starting or escalating the level of activities. Individually, members are motivated to do more. For groups, members are expanding their activities such as farming.

There is also a promise of sustainability in terms of growing capital within the IR-VICOBA set ups. As members grow capital, it was noted that groups are able to advance more loans to members which in turn allows them to expand on their income generating activities. As they continue to save and increase this capital, there are more chances of empowering these activities.

### **NCA's Added Value**

NCA has remained as a valuable asset in the project. NCA played a central and leadership role in conceptualizing and developing of the project. It mobilized and identified the partners to implement the project. It provided resources to facilitate the training, coordination and implementation. It has also gradually built the capacity of the local partners and local citizen actors. NCA staff provided vital technical advice to the partners and during the monitoring visits to the citizens. NCA also provided a link between the local partners and religious leaders with the Norwegian Gas company Statoil. Statoil has invited local partners like TCRS to some of its meetings to discuss issues related to gas and local content. The presence of NCA and its work has also contributed towards advancing the historical bilateral relationship between Norway and Tanzania and strengthening the trust and cooperation between Tanzanian and Norwegian citizens.

### **Challenges**

There are a number of challenges that the project faced. These include the following:

#### ***Programme Conceptualisation and Implementation***

One of the challenges in the programme was that it was conceptualised closely with gas and oil in mind. The expectation was that within the period, the activities will have picked up in the target area after a period of sustained prospecting and that the target population will be closer to the activities. However, generally there is little activities around gas and oil. While the gas is being produce in the ocean in Mtwara area, the closest the population interact is through the pipeline. Oil activities in the four areas haven't really picked up. As such, while the project activities are extremely relevant to the

lives of the population, they are not anchored in gas and oil. For most beneficiaries therefore, these are distant issues and they identify more with the immediate needs. This therefore results in some disconnect, including some activities that were targeted towards possible change in population dynamics and new demand such as those for new product. These have not really materialised as expected.

### ***Wide Project Coverage***

The project coverage was wide and this necessitated that resources are spread thin on the ground. It is likely that there would have been more impact if the number of districts was minimised and the efforts targeted. This oversight was captured in the reflections by NCA and implementing partners. There is a view in retrospect that to have more impact, it may have been more productive to have focused on one district and strengthening the Interfaith Standing Committee on Economic Justice and Integrity of Creation.

### ***Gaps in Project Document Design***

Our evaluation based on the interviews and review of the project documentation shows that this project design, based on the existing reality, was well thought. However, the implementation was poorly designed and as a consequence it was always going to be quite difficult to track the objectives of the project and to benchmark them against the results. As observed from the project documents, the specific objectives of this project were not clear. They were not even mentioned in the project write ups. There was no baseline data in the project proposal and the baseline data and report which was written to support the project was too general and clearly not aligned to the specific objectives and project expected results. It was evident that the proposal was submitted before collecting the baseline and after conducting the baseline the proposal was not adjusted to meet the realities on the ground. For example baseline values would have been included in the results framework and these used as a basis for tracking project progress against targets.

### ***Absence of Theory of change***

The TOC for OfD project was neither developed nor articulated. It was assumed and may be embedded in the project impact statement. Partners were not trained on TOC and none could explain it. They were therefore not able to constantly track the extent to which the TOC was being pursued and whether the activities were effectively contributing to the TOC. More significantly, the extent to which the changing political and investment dynamics in Tanzania's oil and gas industry were affecting the project TOC was not tracked. As the oil and gas operations became minimal in the project implementation area, the project slowly veered towards an economic empowerment project instead of an Oil and Gas Accountability project.

### ***Gaps in Adhering to Timelines:***

The projects have had some challenges in adhering to the timelines. Partners reported that the late disbursement of funding has resulted in huge challenges in the implementation making it difficult to adhere to the timelines. However, the delayed disbursement is not really that of NCA making. Part of the subsequent delays has been due to failure of partners to send their reports in time.

### ***Conflicting Models in Community Banking***

One of the initial challenges especially in the IR-VICOBA among Muslim beneficiaries was the question of interest. The Islamic banking law prohibits acceptance of specific interest or fees for loans of money (known as *riba* or *usury*) and this raised issues in terms of lending within the IR-VICOBA. However, religious leaders, to a large, extent have been able to explain that since the groups are owned and run by members and all benefits circulate within the group, and therefore the said interest does not constitute any excess compensation without due consideration, which is the Islamic law is against. However, these remain questions within the groups especially because more groups are being formed and the population in the Tanzanian coast is predominantly Muslim. Conflicting from other organisations like Agha Khan foundation on the IR-VICOBA. In the future there should be conversations between various organisations operating in the field to avoid unnecessary competition and duplication of efforts.

### ***Structure.***

There were challenges with the natural flow within the structure—from NCA to partner organisation, to IFCs, to the Field Coordinators—to provide clear details in relations to activities, budgets, and trainings. A number of Field Coordinators do not have the information on the actual budget yet they are the one who are in direct contact with the communities. This makes it difficult for them to respond to various questions that are raised. Also, there was confusion of the different roles within the structure, especially between some partner's Project Officers, Field Coordinators and IFCs. There are disconnects especially when the Field Coordinators have duties in their pastoral work yet they have the direct contact with beneficiaries. Either they are not as deeply knowledgeable in terms of project implementation or were also busy with other duties resulting in some challenges. In other cases, succession necessitated by transfers created vacuum. There were also gap in that the partners Project Officers are, strictly speaking, in charge of the projects but they really don't have contact with the target population.

The linkage between DIC and ISEJIC needs clarity-Further bilateral discussions about this at strategic management and partnership level will be essential because of its significant implication on the success of the interfaith approach. Issues that should be resolved include accountability, reporting and coordination mechanisms for the District Interfaith committees. (To whom should they be accountable or report to? How should they be coordinated at national level?)

### ***Communication Gaps***

A number of communication related challenges were identified in the programme. This includes slow or poor feedback mechanism with some players. For example, IFC in Mafia for example has struggled to communication with partner's Project Officer or to get answers to the queries. The District Committee that was established claimed they were left hanging after going through the registration process. There are also issues of IFCs not being informed of visits by project officer, the donor and even trainers within their locality. District IR-VICOBA network is still hanging and lacks information or guideline on how to move forward. In Mafia the IR-VICOBA groups had stopped contributing to the network and were now demanding a refund of their contributions.

### ***Trainings Gaps***

While the trainings played a critical role in the programme and projects, there were a number of challenges. One, some partners did not follow the model to the letter in some aspects. Thus, some IFCs did not fulfil their roles as they had been trained. Number two, the trainings in income generating activities could only target a few members of the groups. Due to this, if one left the area, gaps were left. Third, cascading the knowledge to the group members was not easy because of the depth of knowledge within a short time. Finally, the challenges transferring theory into practice what people had learned was identified. This include obtaining the materials for example to make products, and raising resources to get the materials that are not locally available.

### ***Improper selection of villages***

Some of the villages included in the project had no gas operations and could link the project easily to the gas economy. Excluding villages such as Songo Songo village where already gas operations have been taking place for the past ten years was an oversight.

### ***Resources***

The programme coverage was quite large and ambitious given the amount of work that it would have entailed in relation the resources available. Apart from covering four districts, the desire to establish structures that would build at the national level was ambitious within the constraint of the resources. On the ground, the coordinator had quite a lot of cover. Also, the mobilisation of groups meant that groups continued to form and all could not be served adequately. This wide coverage of the therefore necessitated those resources are thinly spread on the ground to reach all the selected populated.

### ***Challenge working with Costal Communities***

The community along the coastal board have various characteristics that separate them from other areas that NCA has worked, such as the mainland. The residents themselves also pointed to challenges such as low literate, strong cultures, and cultural practices such as witchcraft that affected the implementation. The PETS committee members are not aggressive enough in performing their duties for fear of witch craft and isolation by the local elders. The social despondency and attitude of the local population in the project implementation area towards accountability was different compared to other NCA operation areas. In areas such as economic production, the communities are used to non-labour intensive practices such as turning the soil making it difficult to achieve better productivity. Also, question of lethargy were raised where some people don't want 'to get tired' hence opting for the easier activities. As one respondent commented about goat keeping as a possible practice, "People don't keep a lot of goats. They say that if you rear a goat, you have to be ready to be reared too".

## **Lessons Learned**

From this evaluation, a number of lessons can be drawn from the projects:

### ***Proper contextual understanding of the area and subject is required for proper project design and implementation.***

In this project, the contextual understanding of oil and gas operations and dynamics were scanty amongst the project designers and implementers. Program Officers and coordinators interviewed during the evaluation expressed scanty knowledge and contextual understanding of the petroleum sector before project implementation and learning along the way as the project progressed.

### ***Importance of project design documents.***

Projects documents are critical to informing implementation. During this evaluation, there were noted inconsistencies and omissions of important component that would help proper understanding of the project. For example, there are no clear objectives that were articulated from the start but this were represented as results and outputs. It is important to have clearly articulated design framework it's through Logical Framework, Outcome Mapping or any other methods, to guide the project. This would incorporate the baseline findings. Also, it is advisable to update the proposal to match the realities of the project.

### ***Importance of articulating of the TOC that***

It is important to articulate the TOC that the project seeks to achieve and keeping a close track on this as the project is implemented as an essential part for a coherent, successful project implementation. Training partners on TOC can allow them to constantly track the extent to which the TOC is being pursued and whether the activities were effectively contributing to the TOC. More significantly, the extent to which the changing political and investment dynamics in Tanzania's oil and gas industry is affecting the project TOC can be established.

### ***Importance of risk identification and mitigation measures in project design***

Although the project identified five key risks (corruption, public movements, lack of access to information, security, natural disasters, violent outbreaks and elections 2015) one major risk was missed out. Changing Oil and Gas investment decisions was missed out as a key risk and therefore no mitigation measure was taken when it became quite clear that investment decisions to start Oil and Gas operations would be delayed and the location for construction of the LNG would be changed. These changes made the project to be poorly anchored on Oil and Gas operations whose realities on the ground were farfetched and invisible in most villages where the project was implemented.

### ***Importance of Managing Ambitions***

The evaluation shows this project had ambitious targets and geographical coverage. The project aimed to deliver a little too much in a short span of time and limited resources. The expected number of 1,000,000 beneficiaries reached via media, national level advocacy had no basis for projection. As a consequence, the total number of around 1,331 people reached directly compared to a targeted population of 1,000,000. This indicates that the project poorly performed and delivered below expectations. The project would have potentially yielded more results if it targeted a few areas and

focused at the national level advocacy for economic justice, accountability and change in the gas discovered areas

### ***Importance of Participation***

The accountable resource and governance projects demonstrates that approaches that involve wide stakeholders and are anchored in communities and participation provide broad range of opportunities in addressing various challenges. Through faith leaders and community players, it is easy to build positive reputation making their work in the communities visible allowing them to mobilize extensively. There is a strong case for funding model that recognizes faith organizations working closely with the communities and in the community for better outcomes.

### ***Strength in partnership***

Working with organisations that are already established and have presence in different regions is an effective way to implement projects. It allows ease in reaching the target population while taking advantage of the already developed mechanism. In this regard, TEC and TCRS come out strongly. In the same vein, working relationship between organizations that are at different levels of development can be productive because they allow for expertise transfer. For example, NCA is able to work with smaller organisations such as BAKWATA and ELCT-ECD. It is possible to achieve (or work towards) sustainable interventions in oil and gas by involving different players through identifying critical groups and engaging stakeholders and working using partnerships with existing structures. Inclusion of faith leaders, government agencies and officers, and community structures presents long-term viability opportunities.

### ***Strength of Multi-Level Mobilisation and Advocacy***

Community mobilisation and advocacy efforts across all levels are critical in the oil and gas sectors. As this project has demonstrated, advocacy efforts must touch the different nodes in order to ensure that all that are concerned are involved. Conflicts in oil and gas sector such as those experienced in Mtwara shows that they can touch the lowest level of community and have to be addressed there. Advocacy activities on the other hand need to be addressed either incrementally to the highest level or cascaded from top to bottom.

### ***Untapped Potential in Communities***

There are inherent strengths even in communities that may seem to be struggling. All that is required is the right kind of mobilisation and motivation. The possibilities presented in the VICOBA groups and the work of PETs and paralegals are a good example. Through VICOBA, people are able to mobilise their resources locally for their own good. Through PETs, communities can take over the management of public resources. Finally through paralegals, people can have access to their rights.

### ***Different Partners, different attention***

Working with different partners may require different consideration from the granting organisations. Partners that are strong may not require special attention because they have the relevant resources. However, partners that are not well-established require special attention and closer follow up to ensure consistency throughout the programme. In this case, ELCT-ECD and BAKWATA for example did require closer attention compared to TEC and TCRS.

### ***Social values and belief systems***

Influence of Social values and beliefs on successful project implementation: Societal values and beliefs can be a major hindrance to project success. Beliefs in superstition and possession of witch craft and magical powers by those in authority can limit the ability to follow accountability

### ***Involving women and youth***

This programme has seen very high level of women participation and as such, they are critical to any empowerment initiatives as well as accountability activities. Generally, women struggle to get a seat in decision making processes and are more likely to be left behind in empowerment. Yet as demonstrated, when they are involved and mobilised, they are able to bring a lot of energies and push various agenda forward. Women also make an important component without which communities cannot uplift themselves. Their involvement is therefore a must. Similarly, youth participation is high especially in the paralegals work. Similarly, involving youth is a good practice but tying a project entirely on their presence is not good as they are mobile and will always move for new prospects.

### ***Complexity of oil and gas***

Explaining the dynamics of the oil and gas industry and the impact of a gas economy on to a society can be complex. Quite often ordinary citizens may remotely see the link between the national Gas and their ordinary lives. Anchoring on specific segments of the population like women can be of additional value and a trigger for success.

## **Recommendations**

After considering the different projects implemented under accountable gas and oil governance as a whole, the following recommendations are made:

### ***Capacity strengthening and building***

The project players and staff as a whole are doing a good job in implementing the accountable resource and governance in oil and gas programme, due to noted disparities between partners, capacity strengthening activities and aspects of staff training on the general running of the projects and possible re-alignment of the activities, especially in organizations such as ELCT-ECD and BAKWATA can be helpful. Also, players within IFCs need more capacity building engagements beyond the initial phase of the programme.

### ***Projects Structure***

While the project design is well thought, in future a different option may be considered to ensure a seamless flow. The working with partners and their officers with the Field Coordinators on the ground can be looked at. One option is having a fully-fledged Field Coordinator reporting to the IFCs as opposed to one who also has faith based duties. This would allow them more time and commitment to the project.

### ***Strengthening reporting, learning and communication component***

There is a lot of information that is generated from the projects through the IR-VICOBA, PETS and Paralegals activities. Due to the broad range of players involved, the various contexts and group dynamics, different issues emerge that may require very special attention. For example, in Lindi,

groups in two neighbouring villages were very different. One with very active members in business therefore able to raise contributions while another group consisting of farmers had challenges. In order to address the various realities, the groups will need to be approached differently. Communication aspects need to be strengthened

### ***Trainings***

One of the central component in the programme was the trainings before the start of implementation including among faith leaders. There are also trainings for PETS, paralegals, and IR-VICOBAs. While the other trainings have allowed a more seamless transition into the implementation, the IR-VICOBA trainings have various dynamics. Group beneficiaries noted that the trainings need to bring together new idea while also allowing for utilisation of the local resources. Largely, the trainings did not address the resource available, such as value addition of the farming products that are available. It would be helpful also to include value addition activities that can help the groups take advantage of, among other, coconut, cashewnuts, cassava etc., that are readily available. More regular trainings were also recommended because they were a bit too spaced.

### ***Strengthening IGAs***

Across the projects, the IGA component has performed well at varying levels. Some activities such as farming have done well, as well as those that build on activities what the beneficiaries are already engaged in, for example groups that are selling meat in Mafia or individual who are selling coconuts in Lindi. However, there are gaps in other IGAs and as a result, it would be important for these activities to be approached carefully to ensure that beneficiaries start to engage in viable activities. The projects can benefit from additional expertise in business development. In future, it would be advisable to consider a mix of both new and local activities. Improving on the already existing activities remains an option.

### ***Supporting Paralegals and PETS***

More Support Paralegals, there are various needs and demands that come with their implementation which can be addressed by having an incremental approach to their activities. For the paralegals to effectively work after training, they require space to work from consistently for a certain period of time. They also need to be present so that community can access them when needed. This can only be attained if resources for space are included in the project. Also some form of initial support can be useful. In addition, moving forward, supporting the already trained Paralegals to gain more knowledge through trainings and link to the national network would be beneficial to the community. The PETS Committees also require constant support to ensure that they are properly embedded in their localities and able to carry their work. Finding mechanisms that can sustain their activities for a definite amount of time is important to ensure that they don't lose momentum is important.

### ***Resources***

Looking at the funds available and the level of activities that have been implemented, it is clear that the programme has punched way beyond the weight by covering a wide area with limited resources. While this is very positive where more is achieved using less, there are some gaps in that the spread is wide and the depth is low. There's need for more support to the IFCs for example to reach wider areas

because some were not addressed. This will help to improve on the sustainability. It is therefore advisable to commit more resources in future since there are clear needs and many positive outcomes.

### ***Value for money evaluation***

NCA may consider undertaking a value for money evaluation to document average costs for conducting key project activities like PETS Committee formation and trainings, Paralegal formation and training, IR-VICOBA formation and training. These costs can be benchmarked with other likeminded organisations such as Actionaid, Oxfam, Church of Sweden, LWF, NPA, Care and the Aghakan Foundation. The findings from such an evaluation can be important in informing NCA's future planning and budgeting purposes. This could also form a basis for assessing NCA's effectiveness and efficiency.

### ***Sustainability and exit plan***

As observed, this project had just started and its structures and results are still in nascent form. Consideration this, it would be beneficial if the project can be supported for two more years. But in absence of continued OfD funding, the project can be integrated in other NCA's ongoing activities. In areas like Lindi where the partner still has organisation and staffing challenges, NCA can continue managing the project activities as an operational project. In all districts a tripartite discussion can start between NCA, the partners and the District Interfaith Committees on how the transition should be managed.